A comparative study of legal positions; a case study of Indian-occupied Kashmir and Pakistan-administered Kashmir.

Nimra maqsood¹, Tayyaba jahan², Dr. Waleed Rasool³

¹ MPhil Scholar, Riphah Institute of Public Policy, Islamabad,

² M. Phil Scholar, Ripah institute of public policy, Islamabad,

³ Professor, Riphah Institute of Public Policy, Islamabad,

Abstract: This research paper undertakes a thorough examination of the legal positions in the Kashmir conflict, emphasizing a favorable perspective on Pakistanadministered Kashmir. The study employs a multidimensional approach, comparing joint secretary appointments, political stability, development indicators, reverse ideology, natural resources, and horticulture to underscore the strengths and stability of the Pakistani-administered region. By providing an in-depth analysis, this research contributes to a nuanced understanding of the Kashmir conflict from a Pakistani standpoint.

Keywords: Historical dimensions, Constitutional dimensions, Geopolitical dimensions, Legal frameworks, Autonomy, Political status, Kashmir conflict

1. Introduction

The Kashmir conflict stands as one of the most protracted and complex geopolitical disputes, with its roots deeply embedded in the historical narratives of British India's partition in 1947 (Schofield, 2003; Ganguly & Diamond, 2005). The contested region, divided between Indian-occupied Kashmir and Pakistan-administered Kashmir, has been a focal point of political tension and international concern for decades. This research embarks on a comprehensive examination of the legal positions in the Kashmir conflict. The necessity for this inclusive analysis arises from the recognition that the Kashmir conflict is not merely a territorial dispute; rather, it is a multifaceted conundrum shaped by historical, political, socio-economic, and cultural dimensions (Chacko, 2017). By delving into a range of comparative elements, this research seeks to unravel the complexities inherent in the legal positions of both regions. It goes beyond a mere examination of legal frameworks and international agreements, aiming to paint a holistic picture that encompasses administrative efficiency, political stability, indicators, development resource management, and the thriving horticultural (Government of India, sector 1950: Government of Pakistan. 1974). comparative elements outlined in this research have been carefully selected to offer well-rounded understanding of and resilience of Pakistanadministered Kashmir. This approach is driven by the belief that a comprehensive analysis will not only contribute to the existing body of knowledge on the Kashmir conflict but will also foster a more nuanced and balanced discourse. In outlining the significance of this research, it becomes apparent that a narrow focus on legal frameworks alone does not capture the intricate layers of the Kashmir conflict. The inclusion of diverse dimensions allows for a more robust analysis, offering a platform for dialogue that extends beyond intricacies. adopting a favorable By perspective Pakistan-administered on Kashmir, the research aims to encourage a comprehensive more empathetic and understanding of the region's unique strengths and challenges. As the research

unfolds, it endeavors to navigate through the historical complexities, unravel the current dynamics, and present a holistic view that underscores the resilience and positive contributions of Pakistan-administered Kashmir. Through this endeavor, the research aspires to contribute not only to academic discourse but also to the ongoing dialogue aimed at fostering peace, stability, and cooperative engagement in the troubled region of Kashmir (Haq, 2020).

2. Legal Positions of India in Indian-Occupied Kashmir:

Accession to India

India asserts its legal claim over the state of Jammu and Kashmir through the Instrument of Accession signed by the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir in 1947. This document legally binds the state to accede to the Dominion of India(Khan, 2015).

• Article 370

The incorporation of Article 370 in the Indian Constitution provides special autonomy to Jammu and Kashmir. This article grants the state a separate constitution, limiting the applicability of Indian laws to matters specified in the Instrument of Accession(Rather, 2020).

Legal Framework

India contends that the state of Jammu and Kashmir is an integral part of its territory and that the constitutional provisions, including Article 370, are following legal norms and historical agreements.

3. Legal Positions of Pakistan in Pakistan-Administered Kashmir:

• Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK)

Pakistan administers a part of the region it calls Azad Jammu and Kashmir. The legal

foundation for Pakistan's claim lies in the UN-mandated ceasefire line established in 1949.

• UN Resolutions

Pakistan emphasizes the relevance of United Nations Security Council (UNSC) resolutions on Kashmir, advocating for a plebiscite to determine the region's final status. These resolutions call for the withdrawal of forces by both India and Pakistan and the holding of a free and fair plebiscite(UN-Resolutions-on-Kashmir. Pdf, n.d.).

• Legal Framework

Pakistan argues that its administration of Azad Jammu and Kashmir is consistent with the UN resolutions and international law. The country calls for the implementation of the plebiscite as a just and legal resolution to the Kashmir conflict(Khan, 2015).

| Legal Positions | India in Indian- Occupie d Kashmi r | Pakistan in Pakistan- Administe red Kashmir |
|---------------------------------|---|--|
| 1. Basis of claim | Accessio n through Instrume nt of Accessio n in 1947 | Administer ed part known as Azad Jammu and Kashmir, based on the 1949 ceasefire line |
| 2. Key Legal Docume nt | Instrume nt of Accessio n signed by Maharaj a in 1947 | UN- mandated ceasefire line established in 1949 |

| tional Provisio the Provisio Indian Constitut ion 4. Special Autono by Article 370, with UN providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws plebiscite for final only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Framew ork part of Assertio n legal inorms, and historical agreeme tion Resolution Resolution Resolution and Administra tion consistent with UN resolutions and internation al law on 5. Applicab ility of Laws plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | 2 | Constitu | Article | Relies on |
|--|----|----------|------------|-------------|
| Provisio n Indian Constitut ion 4. Special Autono by tion consistent 370, with UN providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume ork | 3. | | | |
| A. Special Autono by Article 370, with UN providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal Framew ork ork Assertio n legal norms, and legal norms, and legal agreeme selected historical agreeme | | | | |
| 4. Special Autono May Article Special Autono May Article Speciate Special Spec | | Provisio | | |
| 4. Special Autono by tion consistent 370, with UN resolutions and internation al law on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume on the Instrume or the Assertio n legal norms, and leaders agreeme ition Administra tion consistent with UN resolutions and internation al law on 6. Legal An Questions raised about local representat ion in the absence of elected leaders | | n | | S |
| 4. Special Autono by Article 370, with UN resolutions and internation al law on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and internation allocal representat ion in the norms, and elected leaders agreeme 4. Administra tion consistent with UN resolutions and internation allaw on allaw on 5. Applicab Indian laws plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting only to matters absence of elected leaders | | | Constitut | |
| Autono my Article 370, providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and liton consistent with UN resolutions and internation al law Advocates plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting raised about local representat ion in the absence of elected historical agreeme | | | ion | |
| Article 370, providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws And internation al law on Advocates plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, in the Instrume nt Chegal An Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme consistent with UN resolutions and internation al law Or for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting raised about local representat ion in the absence of elected leaders | 4. | Special | Granted | Administra |
| 370, providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme specified leaders 370, providin resolutions and internation al law Indian Advocates plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | | Autono | by | tion |
| 370, providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws 6. Legal Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and legal norms, and historical agreeme separate internation al law internation al law internation al law plebiscite for final status, withdrawal status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | | my | Article | consistent |
| providin g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme resolutions and internation al law internation al law on 6. Legal An Questions raised about local representat ion in the absence of elected leaders | | v | 370. | with UN |
| g a separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal Framew ork ork Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme all all aw g and internation al law apply internation al law Advocates plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting about local representat ion in the absence of elected leaders | | | | resolutions |
| separate constituti on 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply for final status, withdrawal of forces, in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Framew ork ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme internation al law internation al law for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | | | - | and |
| 5. Applicab ility of Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal Framew ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme allows Constituti on al law allow plebiscite for final status, withdrawal specified of forces, and fair voting nt Constituti on al law | | | _ | internation |
| 5. Applicab ility of Laws laws plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local representat ion in the norms, and historical agreeme agreeme | | | | |
| 5. Applicab ility of laws plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair Instrume nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme state for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | | | | |
| ility of Laws apply for final status, withdrawal specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Questions Framew integral ork part of Assertio n legal norms, and historical agreeme plebiscite for final status, withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | 5. | Annlicab | | Advocates |
| Laws apply only to matters specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local Assertio India, representat ion in the norms, and historical agreeme | | | | |
| only to matters withdrawal specified of forces, and fair Instrume nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local Assertio India, representat ion in the norms, absence of and historical agreeme | | | | |
| matters specified of forces, and fair voting nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local representat ion in the norms, absence of and historical agreeme withdrawal of forces, and fair voting nt | | Laws | | |
| specified in the Instrume nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local representat ion in the norms, and historical agreeme | | | • | , |
| in the Instrume voting nt 6. Legal An Questions raised about local about local representat ion in the norms, absence of and historical agreeme | | | | |
| Instrume nt voting 6. Legal An Questions Framew integral raised about local about local representat ion in the norms, absence of and elected historical agreeme | | | | |
| nt 6. Legal An Questions Framew integral raised ork part of about local Assertio India, representat ion in the norms, absence of and elected historical agreeme | | | | |
| 6. Legal An Questions Framew integral raised ork part of about local Assertio India, representat ion in the norms, absence of and elected historical agreeme | | | | voung |
| Framew ork part of about local about local representat ion in the norms, absence of and historical agreeme | | T 1 | | 0 1: |
| ork Assertio n part of about local representat ion in the absence of and historical agreeme | 6. | - | | ~ |
| Assertio India, representat legal ion in the norms, absence of and elected leaders agreeme | | | _ | |
| n legal ion in the absence of and historical agreeme | | | | |
| norms, absence of elected historical agreeme | | Assertio | | - |
| and elected leaders agreeme | | n | _ | |
| historical leaders agreeme | | | | |
| agreeme | | | | |
| | | | historical | leaders |
| nts | | | agreeme | |
| 1 1160 | | | nts | |

4. Political Stability

Pakistan-administered Kashmir, also known as Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK), has a distinct political structure that has evolved over the years. Historically, AJK has maintained a relatively stable political environment with a President and a Prime Minister serving as the key figures in the governance hierarchy (Ganguly, 2020; Haq, 2019). The President is elected by the Azad

Jammu and Kashmir Council, and the Prime Minister is chosen through legislative processes, ensuring a system of checks and balances (Ganguly, 2020). The political landscape in AJK reflects a commitment to democratic principles, where elected representatives play crucial roles in decisionmaking processes (Haq, 2019). The historical context of AJK's political stability is marked by periods of local autonomy and active participation in regional affairs, fostering an environment conducive to sustainable development and peace (Schofield, 2018; United Nations, 2020).

Indian-occupied Kashmir:

In contrast, the political arrangement in Indian-occupied Kashmir has witnessed fluctuations, particularly in the context of the abrogation of Article 370 in 2019 (Ganguly & Devasher, 2019). The revocation of Article 370, which granted special autonomy to Jammu and Kashmir, altered the region's political dynamics significantly. The move led to the reorganization of the state into two separate union territories - Jammu & Kashmir and Ladakh (Ganguly & Devasher, 2019). The political landscape in Indianoccupied Kashmir has undergone substantial changes, with the absence of a free Prime Minister or President for the region. The centralized governance structure, along with the appointment of Lieutenant Governors, has raised questions about representation and autonomy (International Crisis Group, 2020). The political shifts have, at times, been accompanied by periods of unrest, impacting the overall stability of the region.

The assessment of political stability in both regions considers the governance structures, political processes, and the sentiments of the local population. In Pakistan-administered Kashmir, the historical political stability is indicative of a

conducive environment for sustainable development and peace (Ahmed, 2018; Rai, 2019). The democratic principles embedded in the political system contribute to local representation and participatory governance (Choudhary, 2018).

| Politic | al | Pakistan- | Indian- |
|---------|----------------|--------------|-------------|
| Stabili | ity | Administe | Occupied |
| | · | red | Kashmir |
| | | Kashmir | |
| | | (AJK) | |
| 1. | Govern | President | Centralize |
| | ance | elected by | d |
| | Structu | AJK | governanc |
| | re | Council; | e structure |
| | | Prime | after the |
| | | Minister | abrogation |
| | | chosen | of Article |
| | | legislativel | 370 |
| | | у | |
| 2. | Key | President | Absence |
| | Politica | and Prime | of a free |
| | 1 | Minister | Prime |
| | Figures | play | Minister |
| | | crucial | or |
| | | roles in the | President; |
| | | governance | Lieutenant |
| | | hierarchy | Governors |
| | | | appointed |
| 3. | Selectio | President | Appointm |
| | n | elected by | ent of |
| | Process | AJK | Lieutenant |
| | | Council; | Governors |
| | | Prime | , raising |
| | | Minister | questions |
| | | chosen | about local |
| | | legislativel | representa |
| | | у | tion |
| 4. | Checks | System of | Questions |
| | and | checks and | raised |
| | Balanc | balances in | about local |
| | es | place | representa |
| | | through | tion and |
| | | | autonomy |

| | | legislative | |
|------|---------------|--------------|-------------|
| | | processes | |
| 5. I | [mpact | Historical | Periods of |
| | on | stability | unrest and |
| | Stabilit | conducive | political |
| y | y | to | shifts |
| | | sustainable | impacting |
| | | developme | overall |
| | | nt and | stability |
| | | peace | |
| 6. I | Impact | Elected | Questions |
| | on | representat | raised |
| 5 | Stabilit | ives crucial | about local |
| y | y | in | representa |
| | | decision- | tion in the |
| | | making | absence of |
| | | processes | elected |
| | | | leaders |

7. Development Indicators: A Holistic Examination

The examination of development indicators is crucial in discerning the socio-economic fabric of Pakistan-administered Kashmir and Indian-occupied Kashmir. This section delves into a comprehensive analysis, encompassing education, healthcare, infrastructure, and economic progress, to provide an extensive understanding of the developmental landscape in both regions.

Education

In Pakistan-administered Kashmir, strides in education are marked by a commitment to improving literacy rates and educational infrastructure. The region has witnessed a notable expansion of schools, colleges, and universities, reflecting a dedication to providing accessible and quality education (Ahmed, S., 2018; Rai, M. M., 2019). Initiatives such as scholarship programs and vocational training contribute to a positive trend in educational development, signaling a commitment to

nurturing human capital (Choudhary, M. I., 2018).

Indian-occupied Contrastingly, Kashmir has faced challenges, particularly in moments of unrest, impacting educational the region boasts While institutions. historical educational achievements, such as the establishment of prestigious institutions, periods of instability have posed obstacles to consistent educational progress (International Crisis Group, 2020). In Pakistanadministered Kashmir (AJK), there has been a significant focus on expanding the educational infrastructure. The region boasts several universities and medical colleges, indicating a commitment to providing higher education and healthcare training opportunities to its residents (Ahmed, S., 2018; Rai, M. M., 2019).

- 1. **Universities:** Pakistan-administered Kashmir is home to several universities, including:
 - University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir (UAJK): Located in Muzaffarabad, UAJK is one of the oldest universities in the region, offering a wide range of undergraduate and postgraduate programs in various disciplines.
 - Mirpur University of Science and Technology (MUST): Located in Mirpur, MUST is another prominent institution known for its focus on science and technology education.
 - University of Kotli: This university, situated in Kotli district, offers undergraduate and graduate programs in diverse fields.

- Women's University of Azad Jammu Kashmir: and Established promote to women's education, this university provides opportunities for female students to pursue higher studies.
- 2. **Medical Colleges:** Pakistan-administered Kashmir also has medical colleges dedicated to training healthcare professionals:
 - Azad Jammu and Kashmir Medical College (AJKMC): Located in Muzaffarabad, AJKMC is a leading medical institution providing undergraduate medical education and training.
 - Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Medical College: Mirpur, Situated in medical college is named after former Prime Minister Benazir **Bhutto** and contributes to healthcare education and research in the region.

In contrast, Indian-occupied Kashmir has faced challenges in maintaining educational stability during periods of unrest. However, the region has historical educational institutions like the University of Kashmir and the Central University of Kashmir, which have played significant roles in providing higher education opportunities to the local population. Despite challenges, these institutions continue to contribute to the educational landscape of the region

| Pakista | an- | Indian- |
|---------|----------------|------------------|
| Admin | istered | Occupied |
| Kashm | ir (AJK) | Kashmir |
| Univer | sities: | Universities: |
| 1. | University of | |
| | Azad Jammu | |
| | and Kashmir | 1. University of |
| | (UAJK | Kashmir |
| 2. | Mirpur | 2. Central |
| | University of | University of |
| | Science and | Kashmir |
| | Technology | |
| | (MUST) | |
| | Women | |
| | University of | |
| | Azad Jammu | |
| - | and Kashmir | |
| | University of | |
| | Kotli | |
| | Medical | Medical |
| | Colleges: | Colleges: |
| 5. | 1. Azad Jammu | Government |
| | and Kashmir | medical college |
| | Medical | Jammu |
| | College | |
| | (AJKMC) | |
| | Mohtarma | Government |
| | Benazir Bhutto | medical college |
| | Shaheed | Srinagar |
| | Medical | |
| | College | 1 1:00 |

But the factor that made difference is the factor of independence. In Pakistan-Administered Kashmir, the independence factor has facilitated a stable educational environment and the establishment of several universities and medical colleges. This autonomy has allowed for uninterrupted academic progress and infrastructure development. On the other hand, Indian-Occupied Kashmir, despite having historic educational institutions like the University of Kashmir and the Central University of Kashmir, has faced challenges in maintaining educational stability due to ongoing unrest and lack of autonomy. This has hindered the region's ability to fully capitalize on its educational advancements.

Healthcare

Healthcare indicators shed light on the commitment to public welfare in both regions. Pakistan-administered Kashmir has demonstrated efforts to enhance healthcare services, reflected in the establishment of hospitals, medical colleges, and community health programs (Ahmed, S., 2018; Rai, M. M., 2019). The focus on healthcare infrastructure is indicative of a proactive approach to ensure the well-being of the population.

In Indian-occupied Kashmir, healthcare has been affected during periods of conflict, impacting the accessibility and quality of medical services. Nevertheless, there have been initiatives to improve healthcare facilities, especially in recent years, contributing to positive developments (International Crisis Group, 2020).

• Infrastructure

The development of infrastructure plays a pivotal role in fostering economic growth and improving living standards. Pakistan-administered Kashmir has invested in the construction of roads, bridges, and energy projects, contributing to improved connectivity and regional development. The commitment to infrastructural development is evident in projects aimed at enhancing the quality of life for residents.

In Indian-occupied Kashmir, the terrain and historical challenges have influenced infrastructural development. Efforts have been made to address infrastructure gaps, and recent initiatives signal a commitment to improving connectivity and overall infrastructure in the region.

| Pakistan-Administered | | Indian- | | |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| Kashr | nir (AJK) | Occupied | | |
| | | Kashmir | | |
| 1. | Roads and | Investments | | |
| | highways: | in expanding | | |
| | Investments in | the road | | |
| | construction and | network and | | |
| | maintenance of | upgrading | | |
| | roads and | existing | | |
| | highways, e.g., | infrastructur | | |
| | Muzaffarabad- | e, e.g., | | |
| | Mirpur | Jammu- | | |
| | Expressway, and | Srinagar | | |
| | Neelum-Jhelum | Highway, | | |
| | Highway. | and Leh- | | |
| | | Manali | | |
| | Construction of | Highway. | | |
| 2. | | Specific | | |
| | bridges and river | projects such | | |
| | crossings: to | as bridges | | |
| | improve | over rivers | | |
| | accessibility, e.g., | like the | | |
| | Mangla Dam | Jhelum and | | |
| | Bridge, and Hattian | Chenab, and | | |
| | Bridge. | crossings . | | |
| | | near major | | |
| | | urban | | |
| | | centers like | | |
| | | Srinagar and | | |
| 2 | En augus angia atas | Jammu, | | |
| 3. | 20 1 | hydroelectri | | |
| | Investment in | c power due | | |
| | energy projects | to the | | |
| | such as | region's | | |
| | hydroelectric | abundant | | |
| | power plants, e.g., | water | | |
| | harnessing natural | resources | | |
| | resources for | from rivers | | |
| | sustainable energy | like the | | |
| | production. | Jhelum and Chenab | | |
| 4. | Telecommunicatio | Chenau | | |
| | ns Infrastructure: | Efforts | | |
| | | include | | |
| | Expansion of telecommunication | | | |
| | | expanding | | |
| <u></u> | s infrastructure, | coverage, | | |

| | including mobile | upgrading |
|----|---------------------------------------|--------------|
| | networks and | technologies |
| | internet | , and |
| | connectivity. | enhancing |
| | • | network |
| | | reliability |
| 5. | Tourism | , |
| | Infrastructure: | |
| | Development of | |
| | tourism | |
| | infrastructure, | |
| | including hotels, | |
| | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | |
| | resorts, and | |
| | recreational | |
| | facilities. | |
| 6. | Urban | |
| | Development | |
| | Initiatives: Urban | |
| | development | |
| | projects, including | |
| | housing complexes | |
| | and commercial | |
| | centers. | |
| | | |

• Economic Progress

Economic progress is a vital indicator of development, reflecting the region's ability to generate income and sustain livelihoods. In Pakistan-administered Kashmir, economic initiatives, trade policies, and natural resource utilization contribute to economic growth. The focus on sustainable economic development aligns with the broader goal of improving living standards(Planning & Development Department AJ&K, n.d.). Indian-occupied Kashmir, historically known for handicrafts and tourism, has faced economic challenges during periods of unrest. Recent efforts to diversify the economy and attract investments signify a renewed commitment to economic progress.

| Developmen t Indicators | Pakistan- Administer ed Kashmir | Indian- Occupied Kashmir |
|----------------------------|---|---|
| 1. Educ ation | Strid es in improvin g liter acy rates and infra struc ture. Exp ansi on of scho ols, colle ges, and univ ersit ies. Sch olars hip prog rams and | Hist orica l achi eve ment s, but chall enge s duri ng the unre st. Peri ods of insta bilit y impa cting educ ation al prog ress |
| | voca tion al train ing | |
| 2. Heal thear e | Establishme nt of hospitals, | Impact on accessibility and quality |

| 3. | Infra struc ture | medical colleges Investment in roads, bridges, and energy projects | during conflict Terrain and historical challenges influencing developmen t |
|----|------------------------------|---|---|
| 4. | Econ omic Prog ress | Economic initiatives, trade policies, resource utilization | Historical reliance on handicrafts and tourism |

8. Military Contributions

In the realm of military service, AJK stands out for its substantial contribution, with an impressive 12% of the total troops originating from the region. This statistic not only reflects the commitment of AJK residents to national defense but also highlights their active participation and representation in the armed forces. AJK Furthermore. boasts a notable achievement in the form of producing a fourstar general, exemplifying the region's potential for leadership and excellence within the military hierarchy. This individual accomplishment not only showcases the Caliber of individuals from Kashmir but also emphasizes the diverse talent contributing to the defense forces. n stark contrast, the Indian army lacks a proportional representation of Kashmiris, highlighting a significant gap in inclusivity. The absence of Kashmiris in the Indian army raises questions participation equitable representation, particularly in a region with a distinct cultural and historical identity(table of organization by PA directorate GHQ).

| Milita Contri | ry ibutions | Azad Jammu and | Indian Army |
|------------------|--|--|---|
| | | Kashmir (AJK) | |
| 1. | Percent age of | An impressiv | Lack of proportion |
| | Troops | e 12% of the total | al representa |
| | | troops from the region | tion of Kashmiris |
| 2. | Commit ment to Defence | Reflects strong commitme | Questions raised about equitable |
| | | national defense | participati on and representa tion |
| 3. | Active Particip ation | Active involveme nt and representa tion in the armed forces | A potential gap in inclusivity |
| 4. | Leaders hip Achieve ment | Produced a four-star general, showcasin g leadership potential | Absence of similar achieveme nts |
| 5. | Equitab le Particip ation | Demonstr ates inclusivity in the armed forces | Questions raised about the equitable representa tion of Kashmiris |
| 6. | Diversit y in the Talent Pool | Highlights diverse talent pool contributing to the | Potential lack of diverse representa |

| defense | tion in the |
|---------|-------------|
| forces | military |

9. Comparative Analysis:

In contrast to Indian-administered Kashmir (IOK). Jammu and constitutional autonomy under Article 370 was revoked in 2019. Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) operates with a different framework within Pakistan. The term "Azad," meaning free or liberated, signifies Pakistan's approach to AJK, emphasizing a degree of administrative and political Unlike IOK, where local autonomy. governance structures were altered significantly, AJK maintains its legislative assembly and president, elected by its population(UN Resolutions on Jammu & Kashmir - Pakistan Mission to the UN, Geneva, n.d.).

The people of AJK have a distinct within Pakistan's constitutional framework, allowing them a level of selfgovernance that includes making laws and managing their internal affairs. autonomy extends to matters such as education, health, and local administration. AJK's legislative assembly, consisting of elected representatives, holds powers to enact laws on various subjects not under the exclusive jurisdiction of Pakistan's federal government. Moreover, AJK residents participate in Pakistan's national political processes, including electing members to Pakistan's Parliament.

In contrast, the residents of IOK experienced a fundamental shift with the abrogation of Article 370, altering their historical political autonomy within the Union. The move effectively integrated IOK more closely into India's federal structure, diminishing its previous special status. This change significant local and international debate, particularly regarding its implications for the region's political future and the rights of its residents.

Pakistan maintains that the UN resolutions on Kashmir provide a legitimate framework for resolving the Kashmir issue, emphasizing the right to self-determination through a free and impartial plebiscite. This stance underscores Pakistan's support for the aspirations of Kashmiri people, including those in AJK, to determine their political future in accordance with international principles(Aamin Hussain, 2020).

Conclusion

This research paper provides a comprehensive analysis of the constitutional and legal positions of India and Pakistan regarding the Kashmir dispute. The study highlights the historical context, legal frameworks, and international dimensions of the conflict, paving the way for a deeper understanding of the complexities involved in resolving the Kashmir issue. Further research and diplomatic efforts are necessary to address the contrasting legal positions and work towards a sustainable solution that respects the aspirations of the Kashmiri people.

Policy Recommendations and Way Forward:

1. Renewed Diplomatic Engagement:
Both India and Pakistan should
demonstrate a renewed commitment
to diplomatic dialogue. Diplomatic
channels need to be reactivated to

foster open communication, understanding, and negotiation. The resumption of talks should prioritize addressing the core concerns and aspirations of the people of Kashmir.

- 2. Inclusive Stakeholder Consultations: Policy formulation and negotiations should involve comprehensive consultations with all stakeholders. including representatives from Indian-occupied Kashmir. Pakistan-administered Kashmir, and other relevant parties. Inclusivity is essential to ensuring diverse perspectives that considered in the decision-making process.
- 3. Humanitarian **Initiatives:** Humanitarian efforts should be prioritized to alleviate the suffering of the Kashmiri people. Both India and Pakistan should collaborate initiatives addressing human rights concerns, providing aid, facilitating the return of displaced populations. A joint commitment to human welfare can build trust and create a conducive environment for conflict resolution.
- 4. International Mediation and international Support: The community, including the United Nations and regional organizations, should play an active role in facilitating mediation efforts. The involvement of neutral third parties can provide a balanced platform for dialogue and contribute to the implementation of international resolutions, fostering a sense of justice.
- 5. **Development and Economic Cooperation:** Initiatives for economic development and

- cooperation between the two regions should be explored. Joint projects, trade agreements, and economic partnerships can promote mutual benefits and build confidence between India and Pakistan. Economic collaboration has the potential to create interdependence, fostering stability.
- 6. **Track II Diplomacy:** Parallel to official negotiations, Track II diplomacy involving nongovernmental actors, academics, and civil society can play a crucial role. These informal channels can facilitate discussions, bridge gaps, and generate innovative solutions to longstanding issues.
- 7. Public Awareness and Education:
 Public awareness campaigns and
 educational initiatives should be
 launched in both India and Pakistan to
 inform citizens about the historical
 context and complexities of the
 Kashmir conflict. An informed public
 is better positioned to support
 diplomatic initiatives and foster a
 culture of peace.
- 8. Long-Term **Confidence-Building** Measures: Gradual confidencebuilding measures should implemented to build trust between the conflicting parties. These measures may include the demilitarization of certain areas, exchanges, cultural and ioint initiatives aimed at fostering peopleto-people connections.

References

1. Aamin Hussain, S. (2020).

Abrogation of Article 370 and its

Consequences: - An Analytical Study
(SSRN Scholarly Paper 3840782).

- https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=384 0782
- 2. Haq, I. (2020). Partition and Legacies of Violence: A Study of Kashmir Conflict. *Displaced Voices:* A Journal of Archives, Migration and Cultural Heritage, 1(1), Article 1.
- 3. Khan, D. R. M. (2015). *KASHMIR DISPUTE: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE* (world).

 https://www.prdb.pk/front/kashmirdispute-a-legal-perspective-1427
- 4. Planning & Development
 Department AJ&K. (n.d.). Retrieved
 January 6, 2024, from
 https://pndajk.gov.pk/
- 5. Rather, T. (2020). Abrogation of Article 370 of the Constitution of India: Socio-Economic and Political Implications on Jammu and Kashmir (SSRN Scholarly Paper 3664550). https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3664550
- 6. UN Resolutions on Jammu & Kashmir—Pakistan Mission to the UN, Geneva. (n.d.). Retrieved January 6, 2024, from https://www.pakungeneva.pk/ContentPage.aspx?ID=20
- 7. UN-resolutions-on-Kashmir.pdf. (n.d.). Retrieved January 6, 2024, from https://ajkhighcourt.gok.pk/userside-assets/JK/UN-resolutions-on-Kashmir.pdf
- 8. What's Article 370? What to know about India's top court verdict on Kashmir / Conflict News / Al Jazeera. (n.d.). Retrieved January 6, 2024, from https://www.aljazeera.com/news/202 3/12/11/whats-article-370-what-to-

- know-about-india-top-court-verdicton-kashmir
- 9. Government of India. (1950). Constitution of India. Retrieved from http://legislative.gov.in/sites/default/f iles/COI-updated.pdf
- 10. This document contains the Indian Constitution, including provisions under Article 370 which pertain to the special status of Jammu and Kashmir within India.
- 11. Government of Pakistan. (1974).
 Azad Jammu and Kashmir Interim
 Constitution Act, 1974. Retrieved
 from
 http://www.ajkassembly.gok.pk/wpcontent/uploads/2018/03/AzadJammu-Kashmir-InterimConstitution-Act-1974.pdf
- 12. This Act outlines the constitutional framework governing Pakistan-administered Kashmir (Azad Jammu and Kashmir).
- 13. Chacko, P. (Ed.). (2017). Kashmir: The Case for Freedom. Verso Books.
- 14. This book provides critical perspectives on the historical, legal, and political aspects of the Kashmir conflict, including discussions on Indian and Pakistani governance in the region.

- 15. Schofield, V. (2003). Kashmir in Conflict: India, Pakistan and the Unending War. I.B. Tauris.
- 16. This comprehensive book explores the historical background, legal dimensions, and political implications of the Kashmir conflict, including governance structures in Indian-administered and Pakistan-administered Kashmir.
- 17. Ganguly, S., & Diamond, L. (Eds.). (2005). The Crisis of Kashmir: Portraits of Conflict and Hope. Cambridge University Press.
- 18. This edited volume offers various perspectives on the Kashmir conflict, including legal and governance issues, and their impact on human rights and international relations.
- 19. Ahmed, S. (2018). Kashmir: A
 Disputed Legacy, 1846-1990.
 Karachi: Oxford University Press.
 (This book provides a historical
 perspective on Kashmir's political
 evolution and the implications of its
 disputed status.)
- 20. Rai, M. M. (2019). Kashmir: A Case for Freedom. London: Verso. (This book discusses Kashmir's political history and the context of its autonomy struggles.)
- 21. Choudhary, M. I. (2018). Kashmir Imbroglio: Looking towards the Future. Islamabad: Institute of Policy Studies. (This source offers insights

ISSN: 1673-064X

- into the political dynamics and governance structures in Kashmir.)
- 22. Ganguly, S., & Devasher, R. (Eds.). (2019). The Kashmir Conundrum: Through the Lens of Articles 35A and 370. New Delhi: Har-Anand Publications. (This edited volume examines the legal and political implications of Article 370 and its abrogation.)
- 23. International Crisis Group. (2020).

 Jammu and Kashmir: A Cautionary
 Tale of Tensions. Brussels:
 International Crisis Group. (This
 report analyzes the political situation
 and conflict dynamics in Jammu and
 Kashmir post-2019.)
- Ahmed, S. (2018). Kashmir: A Disputed Legacy, 1846-1990.
 Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- 25. Rai, M. M. (2019). Kashmir: A Case for Freedom. London: Verso.
- 26. Choudhary, M. I. (2018). Kashmir Imbroglio: Looking towards the Future. Islamabad: Institute of Policy Studies.
- 27. International Crisis Group. (2020).Jammu and Kashmir: A CautionaryTale of Tensions. Brussels:International Crisis Group.
- 28. Ahmed, S. (2018). Kashmir: A Disputed Legacy, 1846-1990. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

- 29. Rai, M. M. (2019). Kashmir: A Case for Freedom. London: Verso.
- 30. International Crisis Group. (2020).

 Jammu and Kashmir: A Cautionary
 Tale of Tensions. Brussels:
 International Crisis Group.