

RELIGIOUS MINORITIES AND THE ROLE OF PRESS IN PAKISTAN: A CASE STUDY OF THE JARANWALA INCIDENT

*Syed Abid Ali Bukhari, **Nadia Saleem, ***Nauman Khan

* PhD Scholar at Department of Media Studies, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.

**Assistant Professor at the Department of Mass Communication in Virtual University of Pakistan

*** Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication, Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering and Management Sciences, Balochistan, Pakistan.

Abstract- Religious minorities in Pakistan faced yet another act of vandalism by a violent mob in Jaranwala, Faisalabad division of Punjab province. On August 16, 2023, an angry mob of youth set fire to more than 17 churches and 80 houses. The miscreants, as usual, relied on accusations of blasphemy against the Christian community of Jaranwala. The riot was met with widespread criticism and disapproval from the media and wider society in Pakistan. This study is designed to explore and analyze how selected elite newspapers of Pakistan portrayed this act of vandalism against the Christian community. Banking on priming theory, we used qualitative and quantitative content analysis to determine which aspects of the incident the newspapers primed. Our findings show that all the selected newspapers; daily the *Dawn*, daily *The Express Tribune* and daily *The News International* have criticized and condemned the incident in their editorials. All newspapers have highlighted the abuse of blasphemy law by tyrants and hate mongers for their own vested interests. Newspapers have highlighted the failure of lawmakers and law enforcement agencies in the country.

Index Terms- Jaranwala Incident, Violence Against Christians, Religious Minorities, Blasphemy Law, Priming Theory, Content Analysis

I. INTRODUCTION

Pakistan has been in blue waters often times with the issue of minorities. These minorities are either Sikh, Hindus, or Christians that are residing in different provinces of Pakistan. However, these actions are not commendable at all. Often times, extremists that are involved in such incidents use the protection of their so called "religion" to justify their actions. The most recent incident which spread terror through Pakistan's minorities happened in Punjab's city, Jaranwala. On August 16, 2023, a violent Muslim mob attacked Christian community of Jaranwala and vandalized around 19 churches along with their homes and sacred places. They were victimized by violent Muslim mobs that were after two young Christian brothers (Hussain, 2023). In Pakistan, violence and vandalism in the name of blasphemy is incredibly prevalent. This incident was also backed by "blasphemy" allegations. The definition of blasphemy may be that any effort or practice that is disdain towards God or something sacred may be considered as blasphemy. In Pakistan, extremists have targeted numerous minorities on such claims. The Jaranwala conflict started after an allegation was widespread through local mosque that claimed to witness violation of the

pages of Holy Quran next to a home with Christian occupants. The message leaved the extremist group furious, inciting resentment and urging them to be vigilantes. Extremist forces entered Christian communities and torched nearly two dozen churches and created an atmosphere of terror. As extremists avoid the order of law and turn to vigilante justice, the chaotic response in the name of blasphemy resulted in extreme violation of law (Mehmood, 2023). The tragedy serves as a stark reminder of the dangerous results of mob violence motivated by prejudice and their so called "religious passion".

According to the ARY News, the plea for hearing, asking for judicial commission to look against the violent actions of Jaranwala incident was allowed by Lahore High Court on September 11. The Assistant Attorney General was told by the bench to write an in-depth report of the incident. In the violent Jaranwala incident, fundamental human rights of the religious minority, guaranteed by the constitution of Pakistan, have been publicly infringed. The petition stated that because the investigation's current mechanisms were inefficient, the high court should order the creation of a judicial commission to ensure immediate justice for Christian Community of Jaranwala (ARY News, 2023 August 21).

The Jaranwala incident is one of many violent and popular incidents against minorities of Pakistan committed in the name of religion. Given how the drama played out, it is easier to place the blame on outside forces who are adamantly attempting to portray Pakistan as a failed state. This stance can be verified by the articles published by Times of India. I cannot rule out the possibility that Pakistan's enemies, both internal and external, may have written or funded the screenplay for this violent play. I also cannot divert my attention away from Pakistan's legal failure to stop such atrocities from happening because this is not the first time, though. However, one can say with certainty that vandalizing someone or taking matters into your own hands can never be justified. No matter the circumstances, no one has the authority to impose their own law of order except the government of Pakistan.

Lack of free discussion on delicate subjects like blasphemy motivates misconceptions and subtle chaos among societies. These discrepancies between Pakistan's international duties and action, in accordance with International Human Rights, underscore how urgent it is for us to improve our legal system and encourage such hard conversations. The gap must be filled to ensure that Pakistan is consistent with its commitment to international law and is a society that upholds human rights and harmony.

Keeping in view the whole situation, we have devised the following research questions and research objectives of this study;

- How did daily the *Dawn*, *The Express Tribune* and *The News International* cover the Jaranwala incident?
- How and which aspects of the Jaranwala incident have been primed by the selected newspapers in their editorials?

Therefore, following are our research objectives;

- To explore the editorial coverage of the Jaranwala incident in the selected newspaper during the time period under study.
- To determine which aspects of the Jaranwala incident have been primed by the selected newspapers in their editorials.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The Christian community was attacked on August 16, 2023, by a Muslim mob in the Faisalabad district's tehsil Jaranwala. At least 25 churches and several dozen smaller chapels, as well as tens of dwellings, were burnt and looted in 10 different neighborhoods of the town in a single day. Rumors and claims fueled the attacks. A blasphemy allegation against a Christian man circulated in a Christian Town, Jaranwala Following declarations and appeals to action from mosques, using loudspeakers, hundreds of men assembled in town, destroying Christian churches and homes on many occasions. About 500 families live in Jaranwala proper, with hundreds more scattered across the surrounding villages, making them a tiny but recognizable population. The Christian town/Essa Nagri region has a concentration of roughly 300 households, while other neighborhoods are diverse, with other groups in other sections of the city. A vast percentage of the population works in municipal administration or in numerous factories across the city, with only a tiny number working in professional employment (Javed, 2023).

The events in Jaranwala on August 16, 2023, follow a pattern like what occurred in Shanti Nagar on 5th February 1997, Sangla Hill on 27th of November 2005, and Gojra and Korian on August 1, 2009, among numerous other incidents in which mobs gathered in response to aggressive declarations of claimed acts of blasphemy, generally coming via mosques or centers run by established Islamic religious organizations. The issue of discrimination against minorities has been on the rise since 1970 when political parties started exploiting religious divisions and Islamist governments started enshrining these issues while amending the laws. During General Zia's tenure s, violent sectarian attacks, especially targeting the Shia and Ahmadi communities were on the rise (Dawn, 2023 October 06).

As reported by the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, among the attacks against Shias, those in Balochistan against the Hazaras (an ethnic group within the Shia population) are significant. These attacks, which began during General Zia ul Haq's dictatorship in the 1980s, have been aggravated by the rise of anti-Shia armed organizations like as Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), Al-Qaeda, and Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan. At least 386 violent murders of Hazaras were documented between January 2001 and October 2011, and these attacks continue to this day.² On 10

January 2013, twin bombs in Quetta, the provincial capital of Balochistan, killed over 100 Hazaras and wounded 121 others. The assaults were allegedly carried out by the LeJ (HRCP, 2023). Jaranwala is home to around 500 households, with more residents in adjacent villages, constituting a visible but tiny community. The Christian community is centered in the Christian town/Essa Nagri region, with roughly 300 households, although others reside in mixed areas around the city. Many people of the community work in municipal administration or local industry, with only a handful in white-collar positions. Around 5 a.m., a lady in one neighborhood claimed to have discovered blasphemous material tied to a gas meter outside the home of two brothers. Accusations against these brothers circulated swiftly, forcing local religious leaders, allegedly from the Tehreek-e-Labbaik Pakistan (TLP), to reach out to the police and launch a complaint against them. Tensions rose, prompting Christian inhabitants to evacuate their houses. Meanwhile, mosque announcements urged Muslims to congregate and take action regarding the suspected blasphemy, utilizing derogatory language toward Christians. A mob had gathered at the police station by 7 a.m., and a First Information Report (FIR) had been filed against the accused brothers. The accused, however, had already departed their house. Around 8 a.m., the SSP showed up. And secured a settlement with Muslim leaders to wait for the outcome of the police investigation. Despite this, violence ensued in the 'band gali' neighborhood wherein both brothers resided, with church, churches, and homes being set on wildfire and vandalized. As reinforcements were brought in, the situation escalated, and it wasn't until 9 p.m. that calm was ultimately reestablished, due to the Rangers resuming command of the operations. The razing of 24 churches, numerous pastors' residences, and over 80 dwellings in Jaranwala affected a variety of Christian faiths. The attacks spread to adjacent communities, hitting Christian houses of worship and residences, causing extensive damage (*Al Jazeera*, 2023 August 16).

The Aljazeera report quoted the background of the incident and the point of view of the right people "Centre for Social Justice, an independent group advocating for the rights of minorities, has compiled data on blasphemy cases in Pakistan, which shows more than 2,000 people have been accused of blasphemy since 1987, and at least 88 people have been killed on these allegations" and they also reported the point of view of the right groups "Rights groups say Pakistan's blasphemy laws have often been used for personal reasons". The Aljazeera report about the incident is quoted "Mobs burn Christian churches, homes in Pakistan after blasphemy allegations Hundreds of people armed with batons and sticks attack churches in Jaranwala after the holy Quran was allegedly desecrated" (*Al Jazeera*, 2023 August 16).

The Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty reported the incident "Mobs in the eastern Pakistani city of Faisalabad have attacked the local Christian community, setting dozens of houses on fire and vandalizing at least five churches". The Catholic World reported the reason for the attack "The riot broke out after an unverified report went out that two Christians had ripped up a Quran and written offensive messages in it. Without waiting to verify the truth of the story, angry crowds began gathering around the Christian quarter of the city and eventually broke out into a full riot.", they also reported which is quoted here, "messages from mosques sent out on loudspeakers were calling

on local people to 'go out and kill' Christians" (*Al Jazeera*, 2023 August 16).

Religious freedom and tolerance play a crucial role in creating a better society. Four out of every five people on the planet adhere to one religious' tradition. religion freedom and tolerance are critical in creating a better society. Four out of every five individuals on the planet adhere to one or more religious traditions one way or another. To address the difficulties presented by religious variety in a globalized society, it is crucial to develop and promote the new idea of religious peace (Zuo'an, 2013). Based on the recognition of religious diversity and differences, all religions should promote interfaith harmony,

III. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The theoretical underpinnings to this study have been provided from the Priming Theory. The Priming theory as an offshoot of the agenda setting theory serves the purpose of this study.

Priming Theory

Media-priming theory, introduced by Iyengar and colleagues, is based on psychological network models of memory. It suggests that information is stored as nodes, connected via associative pathways. When a node is activated, it can spread to related nodes, increasing their accessibility and potential application to other stimuli. This theory is crucial in understanding political communication. The media-priming process involves activating pre-existing cognitive units or concepts in the receiver's mind through a media channel. This makes these units more accessible, allowing the receiver to interpret and evaluate a target stimulus. A media priming effect occurs when the receiver applies the primed concept to a target stimulus, resulting in a more accessible concept. The first step is the priming process, while the second discusses its consequences (Moy et al., 2016; Lyengar, 2008).

Therefore, keeping in view the suitability of this theory with the objectives of the research at hand we have incorporated the Priming theory.

IV. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Data Collection

Keeping in view the research objectives we have analyzed the initially published three editorials from each newspaper. Hence, our total sample size is nine editorials from all three newspapers. The editorials from newspapers and information gathered from various links serve as valuable sources for our research due to their credibility, diverse perspectives, up to date content. Newspapers, as established media outlets, are known for rigorous fact checking and professional journalism, ensuring reliability. The inclusion of different links contributes to a well-rounded understanding by presenting a range of viewpoints and supporting evidence. This approach enhances the robustness of our research, incorporating varied insights and promoting a comprehensive analysis of the topic. Data has been retrieved from the archives available on the newspapers' websites.

Data Analysis

We have employed the qualitative and quantitative content analysis to achieve the research objectives.

Content Analysis

Content analysis is a strong research approach for methodically analyzing and evaluating the content of various communication

intra-religious harmony, and inter-religious harmony, as well as harmony within the religious community and between the religious community and the broader society. The idea of "harmony without uniformity" must be promoted, and people must learn to appreciate one another and work together to fulfill their social obligations. It is important to fight the misuse of religion for evil ends and to prevent religious fanaticism (Dawn, 2023 October 06).

The findings of the reviewed literature suggest that it is pertinent to explore which aspects of the Jaranwala incident have been primed by the selected newspapers in their editorials.

formats, such as written, spoken, or visual materials. The primary goal is to detect, measure, and evaluate certain content features, giving researchers with important insights into prevalent themes, patterns, and trends. This strategy is used in a variety of fields, including communication studies, sociology, psychology, marketing, and media studies. Content analysis functions as a detective technique for comprehending communication. Krippendorff's observations demonstrate how humans may delve deeply into written, spoken, or visual material to reveal underlying patterns and themes. Walker and Avant assist us in breaking down difficult topics into manageable chunks. We've seen that content analysis is more than just counting words, it's also about determining what's being said. So, whether we're investigating media bias or trying to figure out what people are thinking on social media, content analysis is our guide to interpreting the signals all around us. There are two forms of content analysis: quantitative and qualitative. Researchers use quantitative content analysis to count and categorize the presence of certain components, offering a numerical depiction of patterns and trends. Qualitative content analysis, on the other hand, takes a more interpretive approach, focusing on deciphering the deeper meaning of material by evaluating context, themes, and underlying messages (Krippendorff, 2018; 2009).

Several critical phases are involved in the content analysis process. To begin, researchers must define the exact characteristics of material under inquiry and express a clear research question or purpose. As a result, whether it be written text, audio recordings, video information, or a combination of media, selecting acceptable content for analysis is critical. Following that, researchers create a coding system in which they select variables or themes for classification throughout the investigation. If numerous people are engaged, training coders promotes uniformity and dependability in the coding process. Coding entails applying the defined scheme to the chosen content and labeling sections, phrases, or concepts accordingly. Statistical approaches are used for quantitative analysis, but qualitative research necessitates an interpretive approach to discovering patterns and themes. The last processes include data processing, interpretation, and the development of meaningful conclusions. Researchers express the technique, results, and consequences of the content analysis in research papers or

presentations, adding to a sophisticated knowledge of the subject matter at hand (Wimmer & Dominick, 2013).

V. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Following pages contain the qualitative and quantitative content analysis of the selected editorials from the three newspapers. We have employed the quantitative and qualitative content analysis to analyze the selected editorials.

Analysis on daily the *Dawn*;

The first editorial among the sample of daily the *Dawn* was published under the headline; "Faisalabad rampage" (Dawn, 2023 August 17)". The editorial pays attention to the concerning event that occurred in Jaranwala, Pakistan, where a mob attacked churches and Christian homes after a Christian man was accused of blasphemy. It highlights the absence of evidence in Pakistan's treatment of such delicate matters and condemns the repeated pattern of mob justice in blasphemy cases. The recent incident in Jaranwala follows a pattern of violence that also included the murder of a teacher in Balochistan due to similar allegations.

It also confronts political officials, including prime minister, clerics, and society figures, for their commitment to confront and address the deeply seated issue of religious intolerance. It blames the current crisis on failed policies and decades of official encouragement of obscurantism and the employment of religious extremists as proxy. Our power elite has been silent as blasphemy laws have been misused to settle personal scores, occupy property, or terrorize minorities.

While condemning religious violence, the article focuses on the need for further measures to deal with religious intolerance in both the West and Muslim countries. It calls an end to attacks on Islam's sacred symbols in the West, highlighting the negative impact on global perceptions. Simultaneously, it calls on Pakistani society to bring violent culprits to justice and engage in internal reflection in order to confront the demons of obscurantism that are tearing the country apart.

Drawing on the quantitative content analysis the researcher has found out that the editorial highlights the urgency of addressing religious intolerance in Pakistan, pointing to the inadequacies of the state responses, including a slow investigation and potential cover-ups.

Qualitatively, they call for accountability, condemning the misuse of blasphemy laws, urging societal reflection, and emphasizing the importance of dismantling decades-long policies that have fueled extremist violence. The researcher opinion on this nexus is that clergy and religious scholars should lend their hand to create smooth solution of this most cherished and crucial matter. This group of our society may play their role to resolve this prolonged issue

In summative, the editorial focuses on the events happen in Jaranwala, Pakistan where the violent mob attacked Christian homes and churches due to the accusation of blasphemy on Christian man. Such incidents expose the Pakistan system and how they counter such issues and shows that blasphemy laws mostly use to settle personal scores. On this the researcher did both quantitative and qualitative analysis and shares his finding and opinion.

The second editorial among the sample of daily the *Dawn* was published under the headline; "Countering intolerance" (Dawn, 2023 September 15)". It highlights the pressing need for a

comprehensive response to intolerance and violence targeting religious minorities in the aftermath of the Jaranwala violence. By inquiring people, the panel of civil society experts exposes the inadequacies of the state's efforts to address the issue. The editorial criticizes the lethargy affecting the investigation, emphasizing how police officials attribute various motives to the mob violence, including baseless claims of foreign involvement without concrete evidence.

The panel notes the reluctance of law enforcers to apprehend those responsible for false blasphemy charges, suggesting a potential cover-up of the actual extent of the violence. Moreover, Christian citizens have been unlawfully detained in the name of 'investigation'. Additionally, the caretaker human rights minister's acknowledgment of ongoing challenges faced by affected Christian families adds to the gravity of the situation.

The editorial calls on civil society to hold the state accountable for its failure to protect vulnerable citizens. It urges law enforcement to cease pursuing unfounded leads and instead thoroughly investigate and prosecute those involved in the violence. The prospect of a future mob rampage is raised if efforts to conceal the crime persist. The state's responsibility to fully rehabilitate affected families is emphasized, highlighting the need for assurance that justice will prevail despite the government's initial failure to protect the targeted community.

According to researcher quantitative analysis the researcher indicates a pressing need for a comprehensive response and extent of inadequacies in state response, according to researcher the word inadequacies is qualitative assessment of the authorities response which highlights the actions, resources and policies taken to address this issue. Qualitatively researcher in a negative sense highlights the baseless claims and motives, Reluctance and potential cover-ups and Lethargy in investigation, so according to researcher this all suggests and emphasis a qualitative assessment of investigative process.

However, researcher opinion is that this matter cannot be resolved until social aptitude is not changed. Moreover, resurrection of blasphemy law is not made. This matter must be treated urgently, otherwise the country would go on the way of stray. First of all steps from the government at constitution level should be taken. The editorial underscores the need for the comprehensive response to the extremist violence against minorities in Pakistan, and aftermath of the Jaranwala incident. And shows how some civil society experts and media expose the baseless claims of international involvement and those experts called the law enforcement agencies and state accountable. Researcher suggest the government should modify the blasphemy laws.

The third editorial among the sample of daily the *Dawn* was published under the headline; "Show of solidarity" (Dawn, 2023 August 23). This editorial acknowledges the unusual display of empathy by the government in response to the communal violence in Jaranwala. It contrasts the typical official response of issuing platitudes with the recent actions taken by caretaker Prime Minister Anwaar-ul-Haq Kakar and caretaker Punjab Chief Minister Mohsin Naqvi. The government officials visited the affected locality, expressed solidarity with the victims, and distributed compensation cheques.

The district administration has moved swiftly to assess the damage sustained by the community so damages can be quickly

processed. While praising these actions as a balm for the suffering Christian community, the editorial highlights that addressing the root causes of extremist violence is crucial for lasting change. It calls for the identification and punishment of the Jaranwala criminals and stresses the need to challenge the societal mindset cultivated by decades of state approval indulgence of ultra-right pressure groups. The article questions whether the state will take the necessary steps to undo the harm caused by its past policies.

After analyzing the editorial quantitatively, the researcher finds out the unusual display of empathy by the government some swift responses and concrete actions by caretaker government officials, and researcher in a positive manner finds all this is providing quantifiable indication of government involvement and other quantitative measure is a financial support provided to the affected community.

However, the researcher qualitatively analyzes that addressing the root cause of extremist's violence is important to counter such incidents in future, and it also helps in lasting change.

This matter can be solved forever if criminal law and procedure is once again analyzed and strict punishment is suggested against the persons who take the law in their hands and not follow the law and SOP. The researcher suggest it is once again felt that this very crucial matter and it must have treated most urgently and at war footing level still more at educational level syllabus and curricular should be so made so that this matter resolved amicably.

Analysis on daily *The Express Tribune*;

The first editorial among the sample of daily *The Express Tribune* was published under the headline; "Protect Minorities (The Express Tribune, 2023 August 21). The editorial points to the inability of the State of Pakistan in providing a sense of security to minorities. The provision of rights to minorities, as envisioned by the founder of Pakistan, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, and our constitution is claimed to be absent. The writer points to the lack of interest from the state to pursue those responsible for the carnage of incidents like Jaranwala. A reactive approach is claimed to be adopted by the authorities, which can only be classified as a "damage-control exercise". A central theme of broken spirits of minorities and the crevasses being created based on religion in the Pakistani society is presented. A call is made to implement the law in its underlying intent and true essence, without any regards to gratification of majority groups.

The article uses potent language exemplified by the terms such as "deep introspection" to bring to the notice of authorities the inability of the chairman of Minority Rights Commission in provision of rights to minorities and in the execution of the Supreme Court of Pakistan's groundbreaking ruling of 2014. The ruling had earlier called for a commission to make policy recommendation for minorities in Pakistan, but the functioning of the commission was claimed to be impeded by the bureaucratic machinery of Pakistan. The author underscores the administration's half-hearted attempts at prosecution and pursuit of criminals instigating violence against minorities. This presents a sad state of affairs and increases the apprehensions of minorities. The reactive approach adopted by successive district administrations, their lack of interest and "crocodile tears" are professed to be doing nothing to subdue minority's insecurities.

The editorial points to the need of the minorities to be protected, their rights to be assured as part of the implementation of the "constitutional writ". It discusses how religion was to be kept separate from the workings of the state and how the minorities were free to practice their religion as per the beliefs and guidelines of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan. The "window dressing measures" by the state are to be eliminated while the article advises a "non-partisan" approach in the implementation of the law of the land. The maintenance of a "power clout" through appeasement of majority or popular sections of society by different administrations is claimed to be an "anti-thesis" and contrary to our co-existence. At the end, the important role of religious leaders and community elders in educating the masses is highlighted.

The article is composed of a total of 272 words, broken into two paragraphs. The overall theme is very pessimistic, pointing to the fissures being created within the Pakistani society and an urgent need for recourse by administrations to alleviate the anxiety and fears of minorities in Pakistan.

Negative emotions of the minorities have been highlighted by mainly 16 words. The word "pessimism" and how it is discussed to be "prevalent" perhaps conveys in the strongest sense, the feelings of minorities. Some prominent words that highlight the pains of minorities and concern for the Pakistani society are "fiasco, disgusting tragedies, fear, obstruction and antithesis" "Rights of minorities" have been referred nine times. Words such as "helplessness" point out to the impotence of the commission that was formed as per the Supreme Court's directive to provide these rights to minorities. Quaid e Azam's decree was also mentioned to emphasize minority rights. Instance of violence of Jaranwala Incident was also discussed once.

Positive terms have been discussed a total 8 times. The importance of "non-partisanship" in implementation of law in its "letter and spirit" was discussed to be one of the possible solutions to securing minority rights and these were the most positive words used by the author. The minority's right to "freely practice their religion" also conveys a positive sense. "Co-existence" is also one of the positive words highlighting the need for harmonious interaction among a diverse range of groups in society. The role of "community elders and religious leaders" was also mentioned once at the end to showcase the need for safeguarding minority rights. A total of 248 words can be considered as neutral, however certain words may contain mixed connotations.

The second editorial among the sample of daily *The Express Tribune* was published under the headline; "Christians protest Jaranwala rampage" (The Express Tribune, 2023 August 20). The article presents the news of the protest organized by United Church Council against the Jaranwala incident and their demand from authorities demanding a fair investigation and repairs for damaged houses and churches. It points to the belief the Christian community has about police's inaction despite having prior notification about a charged and agitated mob that vandalized and plundered through at least 19 churches and 80 residences. It also gives statistics about the number of attackers, the arrests and booked individuals, while conveying a sense of devastation and humiliation to the nation.

The protest occurred at the Rawalpindi Press Club, demanding an immediate response from authorities. The journalistic feature

describes eloquently the state of protest, mentioning the use of “placards and banners”, conveying a sense of discontent by those attending. The need for a “fair investigation” and the “arrest” of those “responsible” as part of the central demands of the protestors is also highlighted.

An allegation against police inaction on 16 August has been made by the protestors. Such an allegation is deeply concerning, and if true, should act as a catalyst to bring police reforms. The author further describes the carnage by the riled-up mob and the resulting damage caused to houses and churches, wherein 19 churches and 80 homes were pillaged and despoiled. The writer mentions the makeup of Jaranwala’s Christian quarters, as minimum-wage sanitary workers which portrays the scale of ignorance, apathy, and indifference of the attacking mob. The mob’s detachment from humanity can be sensed as well.

Police’s presence did not deter the crowds of violent mob as they were merely there as “silent spectators”, this conveys the helplessness of the Christian residents of Jaranwala, as those who were tasked to protect them took no action. The mentioning of the arrest of two “prime suspects” along with 145 “suspected rioters” gives hope the readers about a positive culmination of events. “Outrage” of the nation at the event is mentioned along with “embarrassment” as part of concluding remarks.

Quantitative Analysis here are a total of 226 words in the news article, with almost all being either negative or neutral.

There were around 13 negative words. Major negative terms and themes included ‘terrorizing, looting, ransacking’ which conveyed the devastation of the attacks by the violent mob. There were some negative words, that however conveyed a positive sense, this included “outrage” which was used to describe the feelings of the nation as a whole. This “outrage” sheds light on the collective conscience of the people of Pakistan. The negative words of “arrests” and “FIR’s” have also been used positively, portraying police action and the positive outcomes post-tragedy. This action however may be judged to be reactionary, as previously “allegation” was made against the police not acting timely.

The negative words of “sadness” and “embarrassment” has been used by the author to represent the mood of the nation at the tragedy. A total of 213 words can be considered as neutral, however certain words may contain mixed connotations. Some of the major neutral terms were “protests,” “demonstrations,” “houses,” and “churches.”

The third editorial among the sample of daily *The Express Tribune* was published under the headline; “Jaranwala incident triggers nationwide Condemnation Day” (The Express Tribune, 2023 August 19). The news article describes a countrywide “Condemnation Day,” held in light of the Jaranwala incident and subsequent pillaging and “desecration of places of worship” by a violent mob and the “condemnation of violent acts against religious places” being the central theme. The article mentions calls made by various segments and leaders of society for unity against those who violate the rights of minorities. Various conferences and events were described to be held, with widespread disapproval of injustices against minorities in Jaranwala. The article highlights the leading role of Pakistan Ulema Council (PUC) and International Interfaith Harmony Council’s (IIHC) role in holding a ‘Condemnation Day’ and the widespread

“Outrage” against these acts was claimed to be visible during the Friday Sermons.

A demand for “swift justice” has been used to portray public sentiment. “Tarnishing” of “Islam’s image” presents a deliberate attempt by the author to draw attention of the public towards the negative consequences of the tragedy. The “sadness” and “embarrassment of the nation” have been used to describe the collective dishonor of the nation. The article also uses the theme of collective responsibility and mentions how different religious leaders gathered and discussed the role of a Muslim state in safeguarding the rights of its non-Muslim population. The idea of inter-faith harmony and unity amongst various religious segments of society has also been discussed to be imperative. Considering this, various conferences were scheduled by religious leaders as per the story. One of the prominent religious scholars, Mufti Usmani was quoted negating the use of violence against religious places, conveying a collective effort being made in condemning the violent tragedy of Jaranwala.

There are a total of 300 words used in the article, while no relatively single large paragraph existed. Most of the paragraphs are limited to two to three lines. There are a total of around 18 negative words, however, all have not been explicitly used in the negative sense. Nouns such as “shocking,” “heinous,” “tragedy,” “terrorism,” and “shameful” have been used to describe the acts of the mob and the sentiments of religious leaders and the public at large against the Jaranwala incident. Calls for interfaith harmony has been mentioned once as well which helps in highlighting the need of unity. “Condemnation” although a negative word, has been used to describe the response of religious leaders in a positive way. Calls for stern actions against culprit in the article again highlights the conscience of the people and their shared responsibility towards the protection of minorities in Pakistan. No explicit positive word except “probe” has been mentioned while 282 words could be considered as neutral, such as community, conference.

Analysis on daily *The News International*;

The first editorial among the sample of daily *The News International* was published under the headline; “Judicial commission demanded to probe Jaranwala attacks” (The News International, 2023 August 20). The provided article discusses a press conference held at the Lahore Press Club regarding the Jaranwala tragedy. The introduction contains 258 words. The article emphasizes the demands made by Former Punjab Minister Ijaz Alam Augustine and religious leaders during the press conference. Quantitatively, it highlights their call for a transparent investigation into the Jaranwala tragedy through the establishment of a judicial commission headed by a High Court judge. The demands also include accountability for those involved in the attacks on churches and homes, punishment for hate speech perpetrators, and an apology to the state. Content analysis questions the Punjab government’s response to the Jaranwala incident. Specific concerns are expressed about the late arrival of police and administration at the scene, the absence of law enforcement agencies during the riots and the suspension of a Christian Assistant Commissioner. This qualitative analysis shows an important tone for the government to deal with the situation.

Additionally, the article includes statements from various speakers at the press conference, expressing condemnation of the

Jaranwala tragedy and sadness within the global Christian community. Quantitatively, there is an appeal for legislation in the next parliament and the establishment of an internal action committee for the protection of the Christian community.

In conclusion, the quantitative content analysis of this article highlights a focus on demands, questions, and appeals made during the press conference, suggesting a critical stance towards the government's actions and a call for measures to ensure justice and protection for the Christian community in the aftermath of the Jaranwala tragedy.

The second editorial among the sample of daily *The News International* was published under the headline; "NCHR writes open letter to PM on Jaranwala incident" (The News International, 2023 August 21). The article discusses an open letter from the Chairperson of the National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR) to the Prime Minister regarding the Jaranwala incident. The introduction contains 251 words. Quantitatively, the article emphasizes the NCHR's concerns about the surge in social media posts (approximately one million) targeting the minority community with hate and inflammatory content post the Jaranwala incident. The letter expresses worry about systemic discrimination against religious minorities in Pakistan, citing statistics about bonded labor and employment. It urges the government to address long-term challenges related to extremism and intolerance, especially those violating Article 20 of the Constitution.

Quantitative findings indicate that the NCHR's letter demands the use of government machinery and modern technology (geofencing, CCTV) for a speedy investigation, suggesting a strong stance on the need for evidence gathering. The article also emphasizes recommendations for the government to set up an independent tribunal or Joint Investigation Team (JIT) and to revisit the Single National Curriculum through nationwide consultations.

In terms of quantitative analysis, the article employs a significant number of words expressing concern, recommendations, and demands from the NCHR to the government. The overall tone appears critical of the government's handling of the Jaranwala incident and advocates for comprehensive measures to protect minority rights.

Keeping in mind, the quantitative content analysis of this article suggests a focus on the NCHR's concerns, recommendations, and demands, indicating a critical perspective on the government's response to the Jaranwala incident and the broader issue of discrimination against religious minorities in Pakistan.

The third editorial among the sample of daily *The News International* was published under the headline; "Jaranwala tragedy: Interfaith harmony conference seeks speedy trial of culprits" (The News International, 2023 August 24). The Inter-Faith Harmony Conference, convened in response to the Jaranwala tragedy, issued a joint declaration on August 24, 2023, condemning the incident as a sad and condemnable act. The conference, attended by prominent religious leaders such as Chairman Pakistan Ulema Council Hafiz Muhammad Tahir Mahmood Ashrafi and Bishop Joseph Arshad, emphasized the need for a thorough investigation into the tragedy and called for the perpetrators to be brought to justice swiftly.

Acknowledging the federal and provincial governments, the conference appreciated their commitment to reconstructing and

rehabilitating the vandalized churches and houses of the Christian community. The conference expressed support for the actions and ideas put forth by Prime Minister, COAS General Asim Munir, and Justice Qazi Faiz Isa. The joint declaration insisted on making the investigation public and ensuring a speedy trial for the culprits. To prevent future incidents, the leaders proposed a joint strategy and action plan involving leaders from all religions and religious sects.

Additionally, the conference noted the formation of a joint committee comprising Muslim and Christian leaders to comprehensively examine the tragedy. The religious leaders characterized the tragic incident as an attempt by enemy forces to create an atmosphere of anarchy in Pakistan. In a proactive move, the joint declaration outlined plans for nationwide inter-religious and interfaith harmony conferences and gatherings to guide the public on matters of inter-religious harmony, interfaith dialogue, and the sanctity of Namooos-e-Risalat (SAW) and blasphemy laws.

VI. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the content analysis of the selected editorials from daily the *Dawn* provides insights into multifaceted perspectives of the Jaranwala incident in Pakistan. The analysis includes quantitative and qualitative views, giving a comprehensive outlook of the narratives in different publications. In qualitative analysis, the focal point was the frequency of negative and positive words used in each article. Negative phrases continuously outnumbered positive ones in the examined texts, suggesting a general tone of worry, censure, and criticism in reaction to the Jaranwala disaster. The number of disparaging terms was used to gauge the seriousness of the issue and the general disgust that the authors and other stakeholders expressed. For instance, negative words like "violence," "tragedy," and "outrage" dominated the narrative. Favourable terms like "interfaith harmony," "condemnation day," and "unity" were deliberately employed to underline efforts toward societal cohesion and collective condemnation of the violence. Top of Form, the news stories' time frame, which begins on May 10, shows a continuous and continuing discussion of the Jaranwala event, indicating its long-lasting influence on public opinion. This thorough overview highlights the importance and intricacy of the problem, which calls for ongoing attention and a solution.

Specifically, when a newspaper espouses an implicitly opposing viewpoint, the preponderance of negative terms relative to positive ones bolsters this viewpoint. Most negative phrases in this analysis are consistent with a critical perspective, highlighting the gravity of the occurrence and the pressing need for reform and action.

The qualitative analysis of the selected editorials from daily *The Express Tribune* scrutinizes Pakistan's government for failing to provide security and rights to minorities, especially highlighting the Jaranwala incident. It criticizes the reactive approach of authorities, highlighting the fissures being created along society's religious divides. Emphasizing the need for impartial implementation of law that is in line with the constitutional vision of Muhammad Ali Jinnah for protecting minority rights. In contrast, the quantitative analysis aims to

dissect the article by numbers, revealing a prevalent negative sentiment among minorities in Pakistan. It showcases their concerns using words like "fiasco," "disgusting tragedies," and "helplessness."

However, it also acknowledges positive aspects such as "non-partisanship" implementation of law and "freedom to practice religion" as potential solutions. Both analyses stress the urgency of addressing systemic issues to safeguard minority rights. The qualitative analysis urges the need for substantive action, while the quantitative analysis quantifies the widespread negative sentiment among minorities and recognizes suggested positive steps. The qualitative study looks at a protest by the United Church Council after the Jaranwala incident. It talks about how Christians felt let down by the police, who they believe didn't act despite warnings, causing damage to churches and homes and making the nation feel ashamed. They're asking for action and a fair investigation.

The quantitative analysis uses numbers to show mostly negative feelings. It mentions words like 'terrorizing,' 'looting,' and 'ransacking' to describe the violence. Some words like 'outrage,' 'arrests,' and 'FIRs' are seen positively, showing how the country reacted and the police acted afterward, showing mixed emotions. Both studies stress how serious the incident was: the first looks at the protest and feelings, while the second uses numbers to explain feelings and mixed reactions of the Christians and the collective embarrassment of the nation. There are two analyses conducted, the qualitative analysis aims to understand the article's themes and meanings, while the quantitative study aims to interpret the article numerically and gauge the author's sentiments, regarding minority rights. The qualitative analysis discusses the country's response following the Jaranwala incident, highlighting a nationwide "Condemnation Day." It stresses the message of unity against violence on religious sites, showcasing the significant role of religious councils and leaders in organizing events condemning the tragedy. Themes of collective responsibility, interfaith harmony, and protecting the rights of non-Muslim population of Pakistan take center stage. On the other hand, the quantitative analysis, using shorter paragraphs across 300 words, quantifies about 18 negative words. While these words like "shocking" and "heinous" describe the severity of the incident, they reflect the shared outrage among religious leaders and the public. Surprisingly, the term "condemnation" is used positively, reflecting a united effort to condemn violence and protect the rights of minorities. The two reviews have come together to emphasize the shared responsibility and urgency of protecting the rights of minorities in Pakistan after the Jaranwala incident, calling for immediate and immediate action.

From the analysis of the editorials of daily *The News International* emerges an insightful perspective that is deeply rooted in the socio-political fabric of Pakistan. It addresses the requests, questions and appeals raised at the news conference, highlighting a clear sense of urgency and caution to address the concerns of the Christian community. This emphasis represents a critical position regarding government policies and initiatives, supporting efforts that guarantee justice and provide protection to

religious minorities, especially after the Jaranwala accident. Additionally, the research clarifies the concerns, suggestions and requests of the National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR). The NCHR's outspoken stance in the debate reflects deep dissatisfaction with the government's handling of the Jaranwala incident, which reflects larger systemic problems with discrimination against religious minorities in the country. The quantitative analysis reveals a story of discontent that calls for concrete and significant amendments to the policy framework to address these pervasive issues.

Importantly, the establishment of a joint committee comprising Christian and Muslim officials represents a turning point after the disaster. This joint effort not only emphasizes how serious the problem is, but also shows how everyone wants comprehensive communication and cooperation. Presenting this tragic event as an attempt by outside powers to disrupt Pakistani peace adds an important geopolitical element to the story and draws attention to the complexities surrounding the country's stability and unity. Furthermore, the Joint Declaration's proactive measures indicate a focused commitment to long-term solutions and active participation. The dedication to planning national interfaith and interfaith harmony conferences is indicative of a forward-thinking strategy aimed at promoting mutual respect, understanding and communication among different religious communities. By highlighting the value of religious tolerance and the sanctity of beliefs, such as the highly revered concept of the Holy Prophet (Namoos-e-Risalat SAW) and the delicate subject of blasphemy laws, the campaign aims to bridge differences and dispel myths.

Overall, a thorough analysis of the data from this newspaper presents a complex story that portrays the immediate aftermath of the catastrophic event and explores the wider social and political environment of Pakistan. It highlights the complexities, difficulties and goals of a country that strives to maintain harmony, equality and social peace in the face of unrest. Quantitative data provides a prism through which to examine different aspects of this discourse, providing insights that open the door to insightful conversations, well-informed actions, and hopefully constructive social change.

REFERENCES

- "A timeline of attacks on religious minorities over the last 12 months". (2023, August 18). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1770617>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.
- "Christians Protest Jaranwala Rampage". (2023, August 20). *The Express Tribune*. Retrieved from; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2431557/christians-protest-jaranwala-rampage>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.
- "Countering Intolerance". (2023, September 15). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1775914/countering-intolerance>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.
- "Faisalabad Rampage". (2023, August 17). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1770585/faisalabad-rampage>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.
- Hussain, A. (2023, August 16). "Mobs burn Christian churches, homes in Pakistan after blasphemy allegations". *Al Jazeera*. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/8/16/angry-mobs-burn-christian-churches-in-pakistan-after-blasphemy-allegations>; October 06, 2023.
- "Jaranwala Incident Triggers Nationwide Condemnation Day". (2023, August 19). *The Express Tribune*. Retrieved from;

<https://tribune.com.pk/story/2431457/jaranwala-incident-triggers-nationwide-condemnation-day>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Jaranwala Tragedy: Interfaith Harmony Conference Seeks Speedy Trial of Culprits". (2023, August 24). *The News International*. Retrieved from; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/1103233-jaranwala-tragedy-interfaith-harmony-conference-seeks-speedy-trial-of-culprits>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Judicial Commission Demanded to Probe Jaranwala Attacks". (2023, August 20). *The News International*. Retrieved from; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/1101901-judicial-commission-demanded-to-probe-jaranwala-attacks>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

Krippendorff, K. (2018). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Sage publications.

Krippendorff, K. (2009). Testing the reliability of content analysis data. *The content analysis reader*, 350-357.

Iyengar, S. (2008). Priming theory. *The international encyclopedia of communication*.

Mehmood, R. (2023, August 17). "The Jaranwala Incident: Another Month, another Blasphemy Mob". *The Friday Times*. <https://thefridaytimes.com/17-Aug-2023/the-jaranwala-incident-another-month-another-blasphemy-mob>; Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Mobs burn Christian churches, homes in Pakistan after blasphemy allegations". (2023, August 16). *Al Jazeera*. Retrieved from; <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/8/16/angry-mobs-burn-christian-churches-in-pakistan-after-blasphemy-allegations>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Mob-led destruction of churches in Jaranwala, Punjab" An HRCF finding report. (2023, August). *HRCF*. Retrieved from; https://hrcp-web.org/hrcpweb/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/Incident-report_Mob-led-destruction-of-churches-in-Jaranwala.pdf Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

Moy, P., Tewksbury, D., & Rinke, E. M. (2016, October 23). Agenda-Setting, Priming, and Framing. *The International Encyclopedia of Communication Theory and Philosophy*, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118766804.wbiect266>

"NCHR Writes Open Letter to PM on Jaranwala Incident". (2023, August 21). *The News International*. Retrieved from; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/1102192-nchr-writes-open-letter-to-pm-on-jaranwala-incident>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Protect Minorities". (2023, August 21). *The Express Tribune*. Retrieved from; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2431706/protect-minorities>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Road to Religious Harmony". (2015, July 30). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1197155>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Show of Solidarity". (2023, August 23). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1771665/show-of-solidarity>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Supreme Court to hear petition on Jaranwala incident tomorrow". (2023, 21 August). *ARY News*. Retrieved from; <https://arynews.tv/jaranwala-incident-supreme-court-to-hear-petition-tomorrow/>; Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

"Who set fire to Jaranwala?". (2023, August 21). *Dawn*. Retrieved from; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1771334>. Retrieved on; October 06, 2023.

Wimmer, R. D., & Dominick, J. R. (2013). *Mass media research*. Cengage learning.

Zuo'an, W. (2013). Religious harmony: A fresh concept in the age of globalization. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 77, 210-213.

AUTHORS

First Author – PhD Scholar at Department of Media Studies, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.

Second Author – Assistant Professor at the Department of Mass Communication in Virtual University of Pakistan.

Third Author – Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication, Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering and Management Sciences, Balochistan, Pakistan.

Correspondence Author – PhD Scholar at Department of Media Studies, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.