

An Empirical Investigation of the Relationship between Leadership Styles and Performance among Female Leaders in Public and Private Universities of Punjab, Pakistan

¹Sana Batool, ²Ayesha Siddiqa, ³Zainab Suleman, ⁴Faisal Mehmood, ⁵Zahid Hussain

¹Charge Nurse, Lahore General Hospital, Pakistan.

²Nursing Lecturer, University College of Nursing, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

³Principal, College of Nursing, Gujranwala.

⁴Research Associate, Population Welfare Department, Punjab, Pakistan.

⁵Gender & Social Safeguard Specialist, Punjab PPP Authority, P&D Board, Punjab, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

Background: Leadership plays a significant role in the performance of individuals and organizations. This paper investigates the impact of leadership styles on the innovative performance of female leaders in Pakistani Universities using a survey approach.

Objectives: This paper aimed to (a) discover a leadership style practiced by females and (b) discover the relationship between leadership style and the innovative performance of female leaders.

Material and Methods: Several female leaders, including faculty members, heads of departments, deans, coordinators, and directors, from public and private universities of Punjab (a province of Pakistan), were involved in this study. A sample of one hundred female leaders was selected using a multistage sampling method. In the first stage, five public and five private sector universities were selected through a simple random method. In the second stage, ten female leaders (five from each of the social science and basic science departments) were selected from each university through a purposive sampling method. The researchers adopted a reliable instrument to collect the survey data. The collected data were analyzed using SPSS (Version 26). Mean scores and Pearson correlation coefficients were used to discover the relationship between various variables.

Results: The investigation revealed that most female leaders practice the transactional leadership style in their universities. This study also discovered a moderate positive relationship between both leadership styles, namely transactional and transformational, and innovative performance.

Conclusion: The study recommends that various workshops and seminars may be conducted to increase the practices of both leadership styles to enhance innovation in the universities of Punjab.

Key Words: Leadership Styles, Universities, Performance, transactional leadership, transformational leadership

INTRODUCTION

In this age of technological advancement, firms must add creativity and innovation to their products and services. Employee creativity is critical for innovation, according to the literature ^[1]. Individual innovation has been shown to be crucial for organizations to be economical and survive in the marketplace. Furthermore, many businesses are always observing and implementing new techniques to encourage their employees to be more creative and come up with new ideas ^[2]. One method is through leadership, which is regarded as one of the most essential factors impacting employee creativity and organizational innovation. Leadership has also been considered as a key component of organizational innovation ^[3].

Leadership has played an important part in human history, and leadership style has been critical in creating a positive working environment and culture within businesses. The leadership style, in particular, inspires individuals to work hard to achieve the organization's objectives ^[4]. A leader's responsibility is to inspire employees to explore new ideas by modeling learning behavior. Hurduzue ^[5] claimed that a good leadership style can help individuals in a company develop a variety of skills. Leaders and their adopted leadership styles have been identified as the most researched topics in the literature. A leader's conduct and methods, as well as the development and implementation of plans for providing a vision and a runway to reach that vision by leveraging available resources, are documented as leadership styles. Every leader in every business has a leadership style. Individuals employ their leadership styles based on the circumstances, and there are numerous distinctions in the leadership styles used by individuals.

Employees' innovative behaviors and activities are becoming increasingly crucial in improving the excellence and performance of systems and institutions, necessitating their assessment. The majority of educational systems recognized the significance of evaluating innovation and inventive performance in education. They have made this a high priority, with the assistance of critical international agencies actively involved in supporting innovation in this field ^[6-7].

Despite the importance of a person's leadership style and its impact on job performance in terms of innovation, there is little research in the literature on the effect of transactional and transformational leadership styles on the innovative performance of female leaders in Punjab universities. Given the relevance of leadership style and its association with innovation performance, the purpose of this study is to find the impact of leadership style on the innovative performance of female leaders working in universities in Punjab, Pakistan.

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

1. To investigate the leadership styles practiced by the female employees in the public and private universities of the Punjab
2. To find out the relationship between the leadership styles and performance in the public and private universities of the Punjab.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

The current study seeks to determine the association between transactional and transformational leadership styles and the performance of female leaders working in Punjab's public and private universities. The current study used a correlational inquiry to achieve the aforementioned goal. Female deans, heads of departments, directors, and senior faculty members from public and private universities in Punjab province comprised the population of this study. The multistage sampling procedure was used to choose a sample of 100 female leaders. In the first stage, ten universities (5 public and 5 private) were selected using a basic random approach. The second stage involved selecting ten female leaders (5 from the social science department and 5 from the fundamental science department) from each university using the purposive sampling method. To obtain quantitative data from female leaders, a questionnaire-style instrument based on a five-point Likert scale was used. The questionnaire was divided into four sections: section one was for demographic information, section two was for transactional leadership style items, section three was for transformational leadership style things, and section four was for innovative performance items. The questionnaire contained 33 items in this manner. Sections two and three of the questionnaire were adopted [8], and the remaining sections were created by the initial author. The supervisor and experts provided expert judgments on the face, content, and construct validity of the study instrument. Later, pilot testing was conducted to confirm the questionnaire's reliability.

The data acquired during the pilot testing phase was analyzed in SPSS using a scale reliability test. The scale reliability test findings ($=.896$) demonstrated that the instrument is dependable and adequate for data gathering. Later, actual data were obtained with the assistance of a research assistant and an online technique using Google Form. SPSS (Version 26) was used to analyze the gathered data. The level of agreement and link between independent and dependent variables were investigated using descriptive and inferential statistics.

ETHICAL CONSIDERATION

This research was conducted in the Punjab Province of Pakistan. The researcher followed all ethical guidelines throughout the research period. The completion of a questionnaire containing questions about leadership styles and performance is required for this study. This study's participants include deans, department heads, directors, coordinators, and senior faculty members from public and private universities. The participant consent form was inserted with the questionnaire by the researcher. Before data collection, all study participants were told about the goal of the research and given the appropriate permission. The material gathered was exclusively used for academic reasons and was kept strictly confidential.

RESULTS

Table 1. Criteria to assess females' level of leadership style and innovative performance.

Mean Scores (<i>M</i>)	Perceiving degree
Less than 1.8	Very low
1.8 to 2.5	Low
2.6 to 3.5	Moderate
3.6 to 4.2	High
4.3 and above	Very High

The table 1 shows the criteria adopted for assessing the level of practicing females' leadership styles.

Table 2. Mean scores and SDs of female leaders towards their leadership styles and innovative performance in the universities of Punjab (N = 100).

Variables	Mean	SD	Perceiving Degree	Rank
Transformational Leadership style	3.79	0.925	High	2
Transactional Leadership style	3.20	1.051	Moderate	3
Innovative performance	4.02	0.713	High	1

Table 2 depicts the perception of female leaders based on indicators. Table 2 displays statistical data on female leaders' perceptions of transformational and transactional leadership styles, as well as their inventive performance. According to the findings, the majority of female leaders practice transformational leadership, with a mean score of 3.79, and transactional leadership, with a mean score of 3.20. Furthermore, with a mean score of 4.02, female leaders have a strong perception of innovative performance. According to the findings, the majority of female executives working at Punjabi universities employ a transformational leadership approach. It is worth noting that female leaders at Pakistani colleges use a different leadership style in their daily activities. It means that female executives use transformational leadership approaches that emphasize idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration for their people. Furthermore, guys are generally acting as leaders in the educational field in Pakistani culture. Females have a far lower participation rate in administrative roles than men.

Table 3. Relationship of transformational and transactional leadership style with performance of female leaders

Factors	Mean	SD	Perceiving Degree	Rank
Transformational Leadership style				
Idealized Influence	3.74	0.813	High	4
Inspirational Motivation	3.88	0.628	High	2
Intellectual Stimulation	3.74	0.666	High	5
Individual Consideration	3.80	0.737	High	3
Transactional Leadership style				
Contingent Reward	3.43	0.777	Moderate	6
Management by Exception (Active/Passive)	3.06	0.676	Moderate	7
Innovative performance	4.05	0.713	High	1

The factor-wise averages and standard deviations of both leadership styles used by female leaders at Pakistani universities are shown in table 3. The mean scores for idealistic influence, inspiring motivation, intellectual stimulation, individual consideration, contingent incentive, management by exception, and innovative performance are 3.74, 3.88, 3.74, 3.80, 3.43, and 3.06, respectively, according to the data. All of the mean values of the components of both leadership styles were greater than 3.0, confirming that the majority of female leaders in organizations use both leadership styles. According to the results of the factor-wise examination of both leadership styles, there is a considerable difference. Females exhibited a high level of agreement in the case of inventive performance. It was discovered that female Pakistani leaders comprehend innovation and inventive performance within their universities. It means that the majority of female leaders use transformational leadership rather than transactional leadership in their daily work, with some modifications to achieve creative success at their business.

Table 4. Relationship between Transformational leadership style and innovative performance of female leaders

Variables		Transactional	Innovative Performance
Transactional	Pearson Correlation		.380 ^{ωω}
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	100	100
Innovative Performance	Pearson Correlation	.380 ^{ωω}	
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	

	N	100	100
--	---	-----	-----

A Pearson correlation test was used to evaluate the association between transactional leadership style and innovative performance of female leaders working in the universities of Punjab. To determine the association between the independent and dependent variables, one hundred female leaders serving as deans, heads of departments, directors, faculty members, and coordinators were polled. Table 4 shows a moderately favorable link between transactional leadership style and inventive performance ($r = .380$). Furthermore, the p-value results revealed a statistically significant positive link between the independent variable (transactional leadership) and the dependent variable (performance). As a result, it is concluded that when female leaders employ transactional leadership style, their performance improves.

Table 5. Relationship between transformational leadership and innovative performance.

Variables		Transformational	Innovative Performance
Transformational	Pearson Correlation		.472 ^{ωω}
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	100	100
Innovative Performance	Pearson Correlation	.472 ^{ωω}	
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	100	100

The Pearson correlation test was used to investigate the association between transformational leadership style and innovative performance of female university leaders in Pakistan. To explore the relationship between independent and dependent factors, one hundred female leaders serving as deans, heads of departments, directors, faculty members, and coordinators were questioned. Table 5 shows a moderately favorable link ($r = .472$) between transformational leadership style and performance. Furthermore, the p-value results revealed a strong positive relationship between the independent variable (transformational leadership) and the dependent variable (innovative performance). As a result, it is concluded that when female leaders exercise transformational leadership, their performance improves.

DISCUSSIONS

According to the findings of this study, the majority of female executives in the universities of Punjab used transformational leadership styles, while the minority used transactional leadership styles. Female leaders appear to adapt their leadership style to the circumstances. As in Pakistani society, where men predominate, female leaders must adapt their leadership style to their surroundings in order to achieve the goals of their institutions. Female leaders also demonstrated a favourable attitude toward innovation and inventive performance. Furthermore, this study revealed a moderately positive relationship between transformational leadership style and inventive performance.

Similarly, this study found a moderately positive relationship between transactional leadership and inventive performance. According to the findings, female leaders in Pakistani universities do not differ considerably in their leadership styles. They also have a positive opinion of innovation and inventive performance within their firms. These findings are congruent with those of ^[9], who observed in their study a strong positive relationship between transformational leadership style and innovative employee performance. Another research by ^[10] found that transformative elements including inspiring motivation and intellectual stimulation were positively connected with creativity and inventive performance, which validates the conclusions of this study.

Furthermore, Yasin et al. ^[11] discovered that intellectual stimulation had a positive impact on innovation, which is consistent with the findings of our study.

Similarly, other research ^[12-13] have found that transactional leadership has a positive and significant influence on creativity, correlating with the findings of this study. Similarly, ^[14] discovered that there is a substantial positive relationship between employee performance and transformative/transactional leaders in Pakistan. The study also found that in the instance of transformative leadership, the strength of the link between leadership and employee performance was strong, lending credence to our findings. These findings are similar with another study ^[15], which indicates that women are more transformational than transactional.

CONCLUSION

According to the findings of this study, most female leaders in Punjab's public and private universities use transformational leadership rather than transactional leadership. Furthermore, most female leaders demonstrated idealistic influence, motivation, intellectual stimulation, individual consideration, contingent incentive, and management by exception (active/passive). Similarly, female leaders were more focused on results. As a result, female leaders are more likely to practice transformational leadership style than transactional leadership style. Furthermore, there was a moderately positive link found between transformational leadership style and performance.

Similarly, this study found a moderately positive association between transactional leadership and inventive performance. That is, both leadership styles have a moderate link with the innovation performance of female leaders working in the universities of Punjab. Based on the findings, this study suggests that a variety of courses, workshops, and seminars be developed to prepare female leaders in both leadership styles working in public and private sector universities to improve creativity and performance.

REFERENCES

1. Ouakouak M. L., & Ouedraogo N. (2017). Antecedents of employee creativity and organisational innovation: An empirical study. *International Journal of Innovation Management*, 21(7), 50–60.

2. Gu Q., Tang L. P., & Wan J. (2015). Does moral leadership enhance employee creativity? Employee identification with leader and leader member exchange (LMX) in the Chinese context. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 126(3), 513–529.
3. Prasad B., & Junni P. (2016). CEO transformational and transactional leadership and organizational innovation. *Management Decision*, 54(7), 1542–1568.
4. Alghazo A. M. & Al-Anazi M. (2016). The Impact of Leadership Style on Employee's Motivation. *International Journal of Economics and Business Administration*, 2(5), 37–44.
5. Hurduzue R. E. (2015). The Impact of Leadership on Organizational Performance. *SEA- Practical Application of Science*, 3(7), 289–294.
6. Dunne A., Patel R., & Souto O. M. (2014). Study on policies promoting innovative pedagogies that are effective in tackling low achievement in basic skills. European Commission. Luxemburg: Publications Office of the European Union.
7. OECD. (2016). *Innovating education and educating for innovation. The power of digital technologies and skills*, OECD Publishing, Paris.
8. Bass B., & Avolio B. (1995). *MLQ Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire*. Redwood City: Mind Garden.
9. Vincent-Lancrin S., et al. (2019). *Measuring Innovation in Education 2019: What Has Changed in the Classroom? Educational Research and Innovation*, OECD Publishing, Paris.
10. Sethibe T., & Steyn R. (2015). The relationship between leadership styles, innovation and organisational performance: A systematic review. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 18(3), 325–337.
11. Aftab U., Fan L., & Das A. K. (2017). A study of the impact of transformational leadership, organizational learning, and knowledge management on organizational innovation. *Management Dynamics*, 16 (2), 42–54.
12. Yasin G., Nawab S., Bhatti K. K., & Nazir T. (2014). Relationship of intellectual stimulation, innovations and SMEs performance: Transformational leadership a source of competitive advantage in SMEs. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 19, 74–81.
13. Mittal S., & Dhar R. L. (2015). Transformational leadership and employee creativity. *Management Decision*, 53(5), 894–910.
14. Wang P., Rode J. C., Shi K., Luo Z., & Chen W. (2013). A workgroup climate perspective on the relationships among transformational leadership, workgroup diversity, and employee creativity. *Group & Organization Management*, 38 (3), 334–360.36.
15. Rasool H.F., Arfeen U.I., Mothi W., & Aslam U (2015) leadership styles and its impact on employee's Performance in health sector of Pakistan. *City University Research Journal*, 5(1), 272–286.