

FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH THE LEVEL OF JOB SATISFACTION AND PATIENTS SAFETY ATTITUDES AMONG NURSES IN LAHORE, PUNJAB, PAKISTAN

¹Sadaf Saleem, ²Abida Aslam, ³Yasir Rahim, ⁴Aasiya Khanam, ⁵Madeeha Ashfaq

¹Charge Nurse, The Children Hospital/The University of Child Health Sciences, Lahore, Pakistan

²Principal, College of Nursing, DHQ Jhelum, Pakistan

³Senior Research Associate, Population Welfare Department, Punjab, Pakistan

⁴Principal, College of Nursing, DHQ Bahawalnagar, Pakistan

⁵Research Assistant, Population Welfare Department, Punjab, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

Background: The purpose of the study was to assess the factors associated with the level of job satisfaction and patient attitude among nurses in Lahore, Pakistan.

Materials and Methods: This is a cross-sectional and descriptive study conducted in March to April 2023, on the nurses working in two public Hospitals of Lahore i.e. Mayo Hospital and Ganga Ram Hospital. A total of 300 nurses participated in the study. The main questionnaire based on the socio-demographic questionnaire comprises of the age, gender, qualification and work experience. Other than this, two questionnaire were opted to collect data. One was on job satisfaction questionnaire was developed by Nicholas in 2007 the scale has the 6 dimensions including Co-workers, work demands, work content, work load, work skills and rewards. The other was patient safety attitude questionnaire comprised on six subscales, and additional items on demographic information (Kristensen, Sabroe, Bartels, Mainz & Christensen, 2015).

Results: Majority of the nurses were having fatigue impairs while performing emergency situations. Very less participants shares that they were satisfied with the supervision offered to them during provision of the care. The mean score was towards poor conditions. The mean score of the components was less than 3.8 which is towards the dissatisfaction. There was a relationship between educational status and years of experience. Among the lower educational levels the nurses were more satisfied with the job and display more patient safety attitude. Additionally, nurses with more years of experience has less patient safety attitude than other groups of the participants. There was a strong positive relationship between the job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes among the nurses.

Conclusions: There was a strong positive relationship between the job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes among the nurses. Hence, senior clinical nursing personals can significantly improve the patient safety implementation of nurses hence, it is suggested that they should take active part in the implementation of the patient safety protocols. Poor team work was the biggest issue in the low levels of job satisfaction. It is necessary to take steps in reducing the absenteeism and uplifting the image of nurses in the team work.

Keywords: Patient safety attitudes, Job satisfaction, Nurses, Public Hospitals.

INTRODUCTION

Patient safety is an important indicator of hospitals' organizational performance (Welp & Manser, 2016). Approximately 10 % of patients suffer adverse events and half of those are deemed preventable (Schwendimann, 2018). Patient safety is defined as 'the absence of preventable adverse events that are a consequence of healthcare interventions rather than the patients' condition (Bates & Singh, 2018). Healthcare sector predominantly work in the combination of teams provided by teams comprised of people with different specialties and medical competence, effective teamwork is critical for safe patient care (Barton, Bruce & Schreiber, 2018). This includes both observable team behaviors and clinicians' perceptions of interpersonal team processes. Several studies have linked better coordination or team psychological safety to fewer medical errors and better patient outcomes such as length of stay. Studies have shown that reduced occupational well-being or high psychological strain may develop as an immediate or long-term response to stressors and is highly prevalent among healthcare workers which lead to the poor performance in the clinical setting (Finn et al., 2018).

Patient safety is interlinked to that of the job satisfaction. Reduced clinician occupational well-being is associated with objective and subjective patient safety indicators such as mortality ratios, clinician-rated safety and reported errors (Hall et al., 2016). Highly strained clinicians might thus pose a threat to patient safety since patient safety incidents are stressors that may lead to decreased clinician well-being: clinicians report increased emotional distress following medical error (Panagioti et al., 2018).

On the other hand many studies also showed that despite of any other extrinsic factor the patient safety is lies with the ethical sensitivity (Murray, 2017). The studies have shown that nurses believe honest communication about medical errors is valuable if it helps improve patient care and that open patient safety approaches are needed so that issues can be discussed with clinical mentors (Lee & Kim, 2020). There is also evidence that training can improve the ethical awareness of and the communication of patient safety incidents among nurses and when nurses receive positive feedback for openly disclosing information about patient safety incidents, they express concerns about openly disclosing incidents in the future (Kim & Lee, 2020). Based on the previous literature, which examines the factors associated with the nurse's job satisfaction and their patient safety attitudes and contrary to this, there are the studies which share the association between ethical values and patient safety attitudes of the nurses there is the gap studies regarding the association between the job satisfaction and nurse's attitude towards the patient safety aspects. Hence the purpose of the study is to examine the factors associated with the level of job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes among nurses in Lahore, Pakistan.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

This is a cross-sectional and descriptive study conducted in March to April 2023, on the nurses working in the two Public hospitals (Mayo Hospital and Ganga Ram Hospital) in Lahore. Inclusion criteria of the study was staff nurses with the having license, at least 1 year work experience in the present unit and the main exclusion criteria was not willing to participate in the study, were on leave for more than 6 months and having any cognitive impairment or physical limitations. Sample

size was calculated through PASS. Through convenient sampling strategy 300 nurses were recruited in this study. Written consent was taken from the participants.

There were 3 questionnaire distributed to the participants during data collection. The main questionnaire based on the socio-demographic questionnaire comprises of the age, gender, qualification and work experience. The second section of the questionnaire was about the job satisfaction questionnaire was developed by Nicholas in 2007 the scale has the 6 dimensions including Co-workers, work demands, work content, work load, work skills and rewards. The scale has 18 questions and the participants has to rate every item on the 1-10 scale from very poor to excellent scale. The minimum score on this scale is 18 and maximum score can be 180.

The third section of the questionnaire comprised of the safety attitude questionnaire short form is an explorative questionnaire with 31 items comprising six subscales, and additional items on demographic information (Kristensen, Sabroe, Bartels, Mainz & Christensen, 2015). The subscales are: teamwork climate, safety climate, stress recognition, job satisfaction, working conditions, and perceptions of unit management. It can be used to assess safety attitudes across specialties in hospitals. Respondents answer on a 5-point Likert scale as 1= disagree strongly, 2= disagree slightly, 3= neutral, 4= agree slightly, and 5= agree strongly. Items are assumed to have interval properties. Items 2 and 11 are negatively worded.

RESULTS

The results of the participants (n=300) are displayed in the tables.

Table 1. Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

Demographic Characteristics		N (300)
Mean Age (years)	-	33.8
Marital Status	Married	160
	Unmarried	140
Educational status	Diploma in Nursing	178
	Bachelors of Science in Nursing	120
	Masters of Science in Nursing	2
Years of Experience	1-5 years	101
	6-10 years	32
	11-15 years	47
	16-20 years	63
	21-25 years	57

In table 1 demographics of the participants were displayed. The average age of the participants was 33.8 years. 53 % of the participants were married. Most of the participants (59.33%) were diploma holder in Nursing. Regarding the work experience, 33.67% of the respondents had 1-5 years' experience, 10.67% of the respondents had 6-10 years' experience, 15.66% of the respondents had 11-15 years' experience, 21% of the respondents had 16-20 years' experience and 19% of the respondents had 21-25 years' experience.

Table 2. Level of Job Satisfaction among Nurses

S. No	Questions	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
	Coworkers										
1.	Rate the people you work with	23	21	31	25	45	85	65	5	0	0
2.	Rate whether you feel part of a team effort	12	23	45	65	56	27	56	8	5	3
3.	Rate co-operation among staff	8	13	19	54	56	78	54	14	4	0
4.	Rate whether staff place reasonable demands on you	11	23	42	45	57	36	45	15	18	8
	Work Demands										
5.	Rate the support available to you in your job	14	26	36	38	45	56	43	16	19	7
6.	Rate the opportunities you have to discuss your concerns	18	14	26	41	46	48	47	31	14	15
7.	Rate the demands residents and family place on you	47	29	43	29	41	23	43	23	20	2
8.	Rate whether you feel you are doing a good job	13	15	19	43	56	49	43	47	9	6
	Work Content										
9.	Rate how much you enjoy working with residents	14	19	27	19	64	49	48	43	37	23
10.	Rate how your role influences the lives of residents	19	24	19	37	38	39	16	45	50	13
11.	Rate your closeness to residents and families	16	18	24	38	49	37	29	56	30	3
12.	Rate the amount of autonomy you have	21	23	45	34	35	36	39	27	28	12
	Work Load										
13.	Rate your workload	14	19	27	29	35	47	49	46	30	4
14.	Rate your work schedule	18	19	24	29	41	28	26	28	29	58
	Work Skills										
15.	Rate whether the demands of your job are compatible with your work skills	14	19	27	19	64	49	48	43	37	23
16.	Rate the adequacy of the training you have to perform your job	19	24	19	37	38	39	16	45	50	13
	Rewards										
17.	Rate how fairly you are paid	47	29	43	29	41	23	43	23	20	2
18.	Rate your chances for further advancement	13	15	19	43	56	49	43	47	9	6

Table 2 display the job satisfaction level among nurses. Majority of the nurses responded that the work load management in the ward is poor. Many nurses shared that there were not many training opportunities in the ward.

Table 3. Patient Safety Attitude among Nurses

S. No	Questions	Strongly disagree 1	Slightly disagree 2	Disagree 3	Slightly agree 4	Agree 5	Strongly agree 6
Team work Climate							
1.	Nurse input is well received in this clinical area	24	29	67	69	97	14
2.	In this clinical area, it is difficult to speak up if I perceive a problem with patient care	39	49	63	61	67	21
3.	Disagreements in this clinical area are resolved appropriately (ie, not who is right, but what is best for the patient)	49	39	46	52	69	45
4.	I have the support I need from other personnel to care for patients	21	49	64	67	54	45
5.	It is easy for personnel in this clinical area to ask questions when there is something that they do not understand	37	67	69	78	30	19
6.	Health care workers here work together as a well-coordinated team	28	30	51	85	94	12
Safety climate							
7.	I would feel safe being treated here as a patient	39	56	78	99	20	8
8.	Medical errors are handled appropriately in this clinical Area	54	29	96	85	30	6
9.	I know the proper channels to direct questions regarding patient safety in this clinical area	45	49	76	73	50	7
10.	I receive appropriate feedback about my performance	56	53	64	74	49	4
11.	In this clinical area, it is difficult to discuss errors	43	46	67	86	56	2
12.	I am encouraged by my colleagues to report any patient safety concerns I may have	49	39	46	52	69	45
13.	The culture in this clinical area makes it easy to learn from the errors of others	21	49	64	67	54	45
Job satisfaction							
14.	I like my job	37	67	69	78	30	19
15.	Working in this hospital is like being part of a large family	43	59	64	68	38	28
16.	This clinical area is a good place to work	39	49	63	61	67	21
17.	I am proud to work in this clinical area	28	38	92	67	64	11
18.	Morale in this clinical area is high	96	105	29	27	29	14
Stress recognition							
19.	When my workload becomes excessive, my performance is impaired	43	59	64	68	38	28
	I am less effective at work when fatigued	24	29	67	69	97	14
21.	I am more likely to make errors in tense or hostile Situations	39	49	63	61	67	21
22.	Fatigue impairs my performance during emergency situations (e.g., emergency resuscitation, seizure)	96	105	29	27	29	14
Perception of unit management							
23.	Management supports my daily efforts	46	43	94	104	11	3
24.	Management does not knowingly compromise the safety of patients	73	72	56	64	30	5
25.	Management is doing a good job	96	97	65	35	4	3
26.	Problem personnel in this clinical area are dealt with constructively by our management	49	56	78	103	9	5
27.	I get adequate, timely information about events in the hospital that might affect my work from the unit management	54	59	64	59	60	4
28.	The staffing levels in this clinical area are sufficient to handle the number of patients	63	61	74	54	37	11
Working conditions							
29.	This hospital does a good job of training new personnel	96	94	59	63	8	4

30.	All the necessary information for diagnostic and therapeutic decisions is routinely available to me	59	56	94	39	49	3
31.	Trainees in my discipline are adequately supervised	96	65	58	34	37	10

Table 3 shared the patient safety attitudes among nurses. Majority of the nurses were having fatigue impairs while performing emergency situations. Very less participants shares that they were satisfied with the supervision offered to them during provision of the care.

Table 4. Mean Score of the Level of Job Satisfaction among Nurses (n=300)

S. No	Questions	Mean Scores
1.	Coworkers	4.5
2.	Work Demands	5.1
3.	Work Content	4.7
4.	Work Load	4.8
5.	Work Skills	4.7
6.	Rewards	3.9

Table 4 shares the mean score of the level of job satisfaction among nurses. The mean score was towards poor conditions.

Table 5. Mean Score of the Patient Safety Attitudes among Nurses (n=300)

S. No	Questions	Mean Scores
1.	Team work Climate	3.8
2.	Safety climate	3.1
3.	Job satisfaction	3.4
4.	Stress recognition	3.7
5.	Perception of unit management	2.8
6.	Working conditions	2.5

Table 5 shares the mean score of the patient safety attitudes among nurses. The mean score of the components was less than 3.8 which is towards the dissatisfaction.

Table 6. ANOVA Test between the Demographics Job Satisfaction and Patient Safety Attitudes

S. No	Variable	Job Satisfaction	Patient Safety Attitudes
1	Marital Status	0.04	0.4
2	Educational status	0.01	0.002
3	Years of Experience	0.03	0.001

*0.05 is the significance

Table 6 represents the ANOVA Test between the demographics, job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes. There was a relationship between educational status and years of experience. Among the lower educational levels the nurses were more satisfied with the job and display more patient safety attitude. Additionally, nurses with more years of experience has less patient safety attitude than other groups of the participants.

Table 7. Correlation between Job Satisfaction and Patient Safety Attitudes

S. No	Variable	Patient Safety Attitudes	R	p
1	Job Satisfaction		0.8	0.04

*0.05 is the significance

Table 7 depicts the correlation between job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes. There was a strong positive relationship between the job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes among the nurses.

DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

The purpose of the study is to examine the factors associated with the job satisfaction and patient safety attitudes among nurses in Lahore, Pakistan. The demographics of the participants is very unique as all the participants of the study were females hence low levels of job satisfaction can be related to the gender related issues e.g., age and female attributes of professionalism or the image of profession in Pakistan (Bui, 2017; Shanafelt, 2016). Participants had responded that the work load management in the ward is poor. Many nurses shared that there were not many training opportunities in the ward. This finding is similar to that of the stud conducted in Iran where nurses reported that there were very less opportunities in the clinical areas for the clinical staff (Mamaghani et al., 2018). The mean score of job satisfaction was low among nurses. This finding was consistent with the study conducted in Saudia Arabia where the public health nurses have low levels of job satisfaction (Ibrahim, et al., 2016). In this study, the mean score of the patient safety attitudes among nurses were also low. In another study conducted in the Saudia Arabia the doctors and nurses shared that because of the workload and emergency center crisis.

In his study, educational status and years of experience has significant relationship with job satisfaction. In this study the patient safety is associated to that of the job satisfaction among practicing nurses. This finding is consistent with that of the study conducted in Taiwan, where nurses reported that job satisfaction is directly and strongly associated with that of the patient safety practices.

The research has little limitation. This study was conducted in the public hospitals only. Moreover, convenient sampling strategy was opted. In the strengths, the sample size was fairly enough to generalize the concept on the general nursing population. Additionally, the sample size of the research was fairly enough to generalize the concept on the general nursing population. Based on the findings of the study, there are few of the recommendations. Senior clinical nursing personals can significantly improve the patient safety implementation of nurses hence, it is suggested that they should take active part in the implementation of the patient safety protocols. Poor team work was the biggest issue in the low levels of job satisfaction. It is necessary to take steps in reducing the absenteeism and uplifting the image of nurses in the team work.

REFERENCES

- Kim, Y., & Lee, E. (2020). The relationship between the perception of open disclosure of patient safety incidents, perception of patient safety culture, and ethical awareness in nurses. *BMC Medical Ethics*, 21(1), 1-9.
- Lee, E., & Kim, Y. (2020). The relationship of moral sensitivity and patient safety attitudes with nursing students' perceptions of disclosure of patient safety incidents: A cross-sectional study. *Plos one*, 15(1), e0227585.
- Alzahrani, N., Jones, R., & Abdel-Latif, M. E. (2018). Attitudes of doctors and nurses toward patient safety within emergency departments of two Saudi Arabian hospitals. *BMC health services research*, 18(1), 1-7.
- Barton, G., Bruce, A., & Schreiber, R. (2018). Teaching nurses teamwork: Integrative review of competency-based team training in nursing education. *Nurse education in practice*, 32, 129- 137.
- Bates, D. W., & Singh, H. (2018). Two decades since to err is human: an assessment of progress and emerging priorities in patient safety. *Health Affairs*, 37(11), 1736-1743.
- Finn, K. M., Metlay, J. P., Chang, Y., Nagarur, A., Yang, S., Landrigan, C. P., & Iyasere, C. (2018). Effect of increased inpatient attending physician supervision on medical errors, patient safety, and resident education: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA internal medicine*, 178(7), 952-959.
- Mamaghani, E. A., Rahmani, A., Hassankhani, H., Zamanzadeh, V., Campbell, S., Fast, O., & Irajpour, A. (2018). Experiences of Iranian nursing students regarding their clinical learning environment. *Asian nursing research*, 12(3), 216- 222.
- Panagioti, M., Geraghty, K., Johnson, J., Zhou, A., Panagopoulou, E., Chew-Graham, C. & Esmail, A. (2018). Association between physician burnout and patient safety, professionalism, and patient satisfaction: a systematic review and meta- analysis. *JAMA internal medicine*, 178(10), 1317-1331.
- Schwendimann, R., Blatter, C., Dhaini, S., Simon, M., & Ausserhofer, D. (2018). The occurrence, types, consequences and preventability of in- hospital adverse events—a scoping review. *BMC health services research*, 18(1), 1-13.
- Al Azzam, M., AbuAlRub, R. F., & Nazzal, A. H. (2017, October). The relationship between work– family conflict and job satisfaction among hospital nurses. In *Nursing forum* (Vol. 52, No. 4, pp. 278- 288).
- Bui, H. T. (2017). Big Five personality traits and job satisfaction: Evidence from a national sample. *Journal of General Management*, 42(3), 21-30.
- Shanafelt, T. D., Mungo, M., Schmitgen, J., Storz, K. A., Reeves, D., Hayes, S. N., ... & Buskirk, S. J. (2016, April). Longitudinal study evaluating the association between physician burnout and changes in professional work effort. In *Mayo Clinic Proceedings* (Vol. 91, No. 4, pp. 422-431). Elsevier.

Welp, A., & Manser, T. (2016). Integrating teamwork, clinician occupational well-being and patient safety—development of a conceptual framework based on a systematic review. *BMC health services research*, 16(1), 1-44.

Hall, L. H., Johnson, J., Watt, I., Tsipa, A., & O'Connor, D. B. (2016). Healthcare staff wellbeing, burnout, and patient safety: a systematic review. *PloS one*, 11(7), e0159015.

Ibrahim, N. K., Alzahrani, N. A., Batwie, A. A., Abushal, R. A., Almogati, G. G., Sattam, M. A., & Hussin, B. K. (2016). Quality of life, job satisfaction and their related factors among nurses working in king Abdulaziz University Hospital, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia. *Contemporary nurse*, 52(4), 486-498.

Kristensen, S., Sabroe, S., Bartels, P., Mainz, J., & Christensen, K. B. (2015). Adaption and validation of the Safety Attitudes Questionnaire for the Danish hospital setting. *Clinical epidemiology*, 7, 149.